

**In The Matter Of:**

*Tammy Kitzmiller, et al. v.  
Dover Area School District, et al.*

---

*Angie Yingling  
April 27, 2005*

---

*Filius & McLucas Reporting Service, Inc.  
1427 East Market Street, York, PA  
4309 Linglestown Road, Harrisburg, PA*

*(717) 845-6418 or (717) 236-0623*

*Original File AY042705.TXT, 112 Pages  
Min-U-Script® File ID: 3773150886*

**Word Index included with this Min-U-Script®**

THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA  
 TAMMY KITZMILLER, et al.,  
 Plaintiffs . CIVIL ACTION NO. 04-CV-2688  
 vs.  
 DOVER AREA SCHOOL DISTRICT,, (JUDGE JONES)  
 et al.,  
 Defendants  
 Deposition of : ANGIE YINGLING  
 Taken by : Plaintiffs  
 Date : April 27, 2005, 10:00 a.m.  
 Before : Vicki L. Fox, RMR,  
 Reporter-Notary  
 Place : 200 One Keystone Plaza  
 North Front and Market Streets  
 Harrisburg, Pennsylvania  
 APPEARANCES:  
 PEPPER HAMILTON LLP  
 BY: ERIC ROTHSCHILD, ESQUIRE  
 For - Plaintiffs  
 THOMAS MORE LAW CENTER  
 BY: PATRICK T. GILLEN, ESQUIRE  
 For - Defendants  
 ALSO PRESENT: SHEILA HARKINS

Page 2

(1)	INDEX	
(2)	WITNESS	
(3)	RICHARD NILSEN	Examination
(4)	By Mr. Rothschild	3
(5)	By Mr. Gillen	42
(6)		
(7)	EXHIBITS	
(8)	Plaintiffs Exhibits	Page
(9)	52. Article Dover Area Loses and Official, Again 29	
	which appeared in the Tuesday, December 7, 2004	
(10)	Daily Record, pages P 01397 and P 01398.	
(11)	53. December 6, 2004 Memo from Angie Yingling to 36	
	The Dover Area SD Board of School Directors, page	
(12)	P 01534.	
(13)	54. Article Board Member Says the Worst Is Coming 37	
	Which appeared in the Wednesday, December 8,	
(14)	2004 Daily Record, pages P 01399 and P 01400.	
(15)		
(16)		
(17)		
(18)		
(19)		
(20)		
(21)		
(22)		
(23)		
(24)		
(25)		

Page 3

# STIPULATION

(1) It is hereby stipulated by and between the  
 (2) respective parties that sealing, certification and filing  
 (3) are waived; and that all objections except as to the form  
 (4) of the question are reserved until the time of trial.  
 (5)

(6) ANGIE YINGLING, called as a witness, being duly  
 (7) sworn, was examined and testified, as follows:  
 (8)

## BY MR. ROTHSCHILD:

(9) Q: Good morning, Ms. Yingling. I have introduced myself  
 (10) off the record, but let me do it on the record. My  
 (11) name is Eric Rothschild. I am with the law firm of  
 (12) Pepper Hamilton, and your deposition is being taken in  
 (13) the matter that has been captioned Kitzmiller versus the  
 (14) Dover Area School District; do you understand that?  
 (15)

(16) A: Yes.

(17) Q: Have you ever participated in a deposition before?

(18) A: I think so, yes. It has been a while.

(19) Q: More than once?

(20) A: I am trying to think of what I would have been involved  
 (21) in. It is usually like zoning in Dover or helping my  
 (22) dad with zoning.  
 (23)

(24) Q: In that context, you have actually had your deposition  
 (25) taken in the form that we are doing today with a court

Page 4

(1) reporter?

(2) A: Yes.

(3) Q: Taking down your testimony?

(4) A: Yes, correct.

(5) Q: In this process, I am going to be asking you questions,  
 (6) and you are going to be giving me answers. Vicki here  
 (7) is going to be taking those questions and answers down  
 (8) in order to create a written record of the deposition.

(9) A: Okay.

(10) Q: In order to make that easier, we both have to try and do  
 (11) a few things. One is not to talk too quickly, which is  
 (12) usually my shortcoming. Okay?

(13) Another thing is that when I ask you questions, I  
 (14) am going to ask you to wait and make sure that my  
 (15) question is finished before you give your answer. In  
 (16) normal conversation, we often anticipate what each other  
 (17) is going to say and interrupt to provide an answer. And  
 (18) we are almost always correct.

(19) But in this process where we are trying to get a  
 (20) clearer written record, if we do that, it may muddy the  
 (21) record up. So if you could just wait until my questions  
 (22) are done, as you are doing now, I would appreciate that.

(23) Okay?

(24) A: Sure.

(25) Q: Similarly, I will endeavor to do the same. Eh as you

Page 13

[1] School Board meeting?  
[2] A: Okay.  
[3] Q: Do you see that?  
[4] A: Yes.  
[5] Q: There is reference to discussions over a new biology  
[6] book for the high school; do you see that?  
[7] A: Yeah.  
[8] Q: And in that article, it attributes to Mr. Buckingham the  
[9] statement nowhere in the Constitution does it call for  
[10] separation of church and state. Do you see that?  
[11] A: Yeah.  
[12] Q: Do you remember Mr. Buckingham making a statement to  
[13] that effect in a meeting in June discussing the biology  
[14] curriculum?  
[15] A: Yes.  
[16] Q: And then further down the page, there is a statement  
[17] attributed to Mr. Buckingham 2,000 years ago someone  
[18] died on a cross, can't someone take a stand for him; do  
[19] you see that?  
[20] A: Yes.  
[21] Q: Do you remember Mr. Buckingham making that statement?  
[22] A: Oh, yes.  
[23] Q: Do you remember it occurring around this June time  
[24] period in relation to discussion of the biology  
[25] curriculum?

Page 14

[1] A: Yes.  
[2] Q: During these meetings in June, 2004, do you remember  
[3] Mr. Buckingham making statements about his desire to  
[4] have Creationism taught alongside Evolution or to  
[5] purchase — let me just ask that question.  
[6] A: Yes.  
[7] Q: And do you remember any other School Board members  
[8] making statements in support of that same proposition?  
[9] A: Probably, but it's too long. Too much time has passed.  
[10] I guess. I mean it's nothing wrong I guess with  
[11] teaching everything. I am sure they did. I just can't  
[12] sit here and recall any of them to tell you their names  
[13] or anything.  
[14] Q: You do remember Mr. Buckingham making statements to that  
[15] effect?  
[16] A: Yes. He yells a lot, yes. That's why I remember that.  
[17] I asked Casey Brown when it was. She said June. That  
[18] is why I asked Casey. I need dates here because I can't  
[19] remember all this stuff, but I remember it.  
[20] Q: You remember Mr. Buckingham making statements about  
[21] teaching Creationism?  
[22] A: Usually fights with Jeff.  
[23] Q: Can I get a yes or no answer?  
[24] A: Yes, yes.  
[25] Q: Thank you. Do you recall that there was a meeting in

Page 15

[1] August, 2004 in which the Board voted on whether to  
[2] purchase the Miller-Levin Biology textbook?  
[3] A: Yes.  
[4] Q: And do you recall that the first vote about whether to  
[5] make purchase was deadlocked four to four?  
[6] A: Yes.  
[7] Q: And in that first vote, am I correct in understanding  
[8] that you voted against the purchase of the biology  
[9] textbook?  
[10] A: Correct.  
[11] Q: And then in that same meeting, did you switch your vote?  
[12] A: Yes.  
[13] Q: Why did you vote against purchase in that first vote?  
[14] A: Well, when you first think about it, it seems like a  
[15] good idea. Then as you have more discussion and you  
[16] realize there's people that don't agree, you know, and  
[17] why they don't agree, then I changed my mind. I thought  
[18] maybe we better just stick to the usual.  
[19] Q: Can you explain why you thought on first consideration  
[20] that that voting against the purchase was a good idea?  
[21] A: Well, I tried to help Bill out. I know what he is  
[22] trying to do. If it is going to upset a lot of people,  
[23] then you got to be responsible to everybody too, not  
[24] just Bill.  
[25] Q: Why were you trying to help Bill out?

Page 16

[1] A: Well, you know, he wants kids to understand that you  
[2] might not be descended from apes, you know, something  
[3] against Darwin's Theory.  
[4] Q: How would your vote against the purchase of the biology  
[5] textbook help Bill out or help that objective of Bill's?  
[6] A: I was trying to just going along with Bill to get some  
[7] of his things through. It is lobbying. But there's a  
[8] limit to that, too, what you can do.  
[9] Q: Was the reason that Bill — and we are referring to Bill  
[10] Buckingham I take it?  
[11] A: Yes.  
[12] Q: Was the reason that he wanted to vote against the  
[13] biology textbook because he wanted Of Pandas voted along  
[14] with it?  
[15] A: Right, correct.  
[16] Q: And that was what you were trying to help him out in  
[17] doing?  
[18] A: Right, yeah. He wants some different ideas.  
[19] Q: Can you explain again why you switched your vote to vote  
[20] for the purchase of the textbook?  
[21] A: Well, there was such a strong reaction from the audience  
[22] that I remember, yelling. And I am on the end so you  
[23] hear it out of your right ear more, the complaining and  
[24] yelling and everything that goes on at all these  
[25] meetings.

Page 17

[1] Back then, it was way more out of control than it  
[2] is now because Alan was President. Sheila got it under  
[3] better control. Alan never had control. They yell and  
[4] scream and act like nuts. That is the opposition to the  
[5] School Board now. They are here now. I mean running  
[6] against them, some of them.

[7] Q: After you switched your vote, did anyone on the Board  
[8] say anything to you about your switch?

[9] A: Yeah. Bill was very unhappy with me.

[10] Q: Can you remember what he said?

[11] A: Yes. He yelled at me look at what you have done. Look  
[12] at what you have done. How can you be so stupid? I  
[13] can't believe you did this. Why? Why? He was really  
[14] mad, really mad at me. That has happened before.

[15] Q: Did he say anything else besides — can you remember  
[16] anything else he said besides those kind of statements?

[17] A: Well, the court reporter was standing right there. They  
[18] all know. He just was yelling at me for a while. They  
[19] were standing right there writing everything down, the  
[20] reporter. He really gave it to me.

[21] Q: When you say a reporter, I think you first said a court  
[22] reporter.

[23] A: Joe Maldonado from the York Daily Record. I think there  
[24] was another one there, the heavyset girl that had a  
[25] baby. I can't think of her name.

Page 18

[1] Q: I am not sure I am going to volunteer it.

[2] A: I don't know her name. She was there. I think she  
[3] left. She had another baby. She had two babies. Now  
[4] she left. I don't think she does it anymore. I can't  
[5] think of her name, blonde hair.

[6] Q: That is all right. We are going to mark this  
[7] confidential.

[8] A: She was pregnant. That is why she was —

[9] Q: I am going to show you an article by Mr. Maldonado dated  
[10] August 4th, 2004 in the York Daily Record which is also  
[11] part of P-4.

[12] If you read through that article, do you  
[13] understand it to be a report on the vote regarding the  
[14] biology textbook that we were just talking about?

[15] Let me know when you are done.

[16] A: It's coming back. This is a long time ago, but yes.

[17] Q: So this is an article about the April — the August  
[18] meeting we were talking about where the purchase of the  
[19] biology book was approved; is that right, Ms. Yingling?

[20] A: Yeah. This is the other meeting, right, the August 4th  
[21] meeting, not the next one, right.

[22] Q: Am I correct in understanding, Ms. Yingling, that this  
[23] is an article about the Miller Levin standard biology  
[24] textbook was approved?

[25] A: There's more. We had conversation, me and Bill. He was

Page 19

[1] very upset with me. He felt I set everybody back. I am  
[2] sure I did.

[3] There was so much problem with that vote. And  
[4] when everybody in the room is yelling about a problem,  
[5] you have got to reconsider sometimes. And, of course,  
[6] Dr. Nilsen was visibly upset. I remember this because  
[7] it said Nilsen here — Superintendent Richard Nilsen. I  
[8] knew I could clearly see he was distressed about it  
[9] because it is a big change.

[10] Q: Now in the article on the first page it says that after  
[11] the first vote, Mr. Buckingham said he would approve the  
[12] biology book if the Board would also approve a companion  
[13] book Of Pandas and People?

[14] A: Right.

[15] Q: Do you remember him saying that?

[16] A: Yeah, that's what he wanted really. I don't think  
[17] anybody wanted to change everything.

[18] Q: He is quoted as saying if we don't get our book, you  
[19] don't get yours; do you remember him saying that?

[20] A: Him and Jeff are fighting as usual, yes.

[21] Q: Do you remember him making that statement?

[22] A: Yes, yes, yes.

[23] Q: And on the second page, it attributes to Mr. Buckingham  
[24] saying to you I can't believe you did that, do you know  
[25] what you've done; and that is consistent with your

Page 20

[1] memory?

[2] A: That's where I believe there was more than that. That  
[3] was said. He was really mad. Yes, he yelled at me. He  
[4] said I can't believe you did that. Do you know what you  
[5] done? He was yelling while the reporter was standing  
[6] right there. Yes.

[7] Q: Did anybody other than Mr. Buckingham say anything to  
[8] you after you switched your vote?

[9] A: No, I don't believe so.

[10] Q: Do you remember that there was also a meeting in October  
[11] in which there was a vote about whether to change the  
[12] biology curriculum?

[13] A: Yes.

[14] Q: I am going to show you an exhibit that we have marked  
[15] previously as P-8 which is a Biology Planned Course  
[16] Curriculum Guide that we pulled from the Dover website.  
[17] I want to turn your attention to the bottom of the page  
[18] marked P-01646 and the language in the bottom under Unit  
[19] Content Concepts.

[20] A: Okay.

[21] Q: Do you see the language towards the bottom which says  
[22] students will be made aware of gaps/problems in Darwin's  
[23] Theory and of other Theories of Evolution including, but  
[24] not limited to, Intelligent Design?

[25] A: Right.

Page 21

[1] Q: Note, the origins of life is not taught. Is that the  
[2] language that was added to the biology curriculum when  
[3] the Board voted in October of 2004?  
[4] A: Yes.  
[5] Q: And I am correct in understanding that you voted for  
[6] that resolution at that meeting?  
[7] A: Yes.  
[8] Q: What is your understanding of what Intelligent Design  
[9] means in this resolution?  
[10] A: Well, it just means life is so complicated, it couldn't  
[11] have possibly been, you know, just done by accident. It  
[12] would be an intelligent creator. That's how I view it.  
[13] Just my opinion.  
[14] Q: Where did you get that understanding from?  
[15] A: Reading.  
[16] Q: What did you read to get that understanding?  
[17] A: Just various books, you know, over the years. None of  
[18] them come to mind. Just mostly the whole argument of  
[19] Darwinism versus this.  
[20] Q: When you use the words intelligent creator, are you  
[21] referring — do you have an understanding of some  
[22] specific kind of creator?  
[23] A: I view it as God. That is my personal take on it, you  
[24] know.  
[25] Q: What is your understanding of the note, the origins of

Page 22

[1] life is not taught, what is your understanding of what  
[2] that means in this resolution?  
[3] A: Not to get into a messy argument about God with  
[4] atheists, you know. In other words, you are not trying  
[5] to make it church. You are trying to make it school.  
[6] Q: And am I correct in understanding that you have read  
[7] books on this subject, but you can't identify any of  
[8] them by name?  
[9] A: I think it is mostly articles more than just sitting  
[10] down and reading a whole book. I generally don't read  
[11] books cover to cover unless they are really good. And  
[12] bio certainly wouldn't be really good in my personal  
[13] library.  
[14] It is mostly articles more than books. Just  
[15] passing through reading various pieces of a book or  
[16] articles on it on the whole debate.  
[17] Q: Did you do any of this reading prior to this issue of  
[18] the biology curriculum arising in Dover?  
[19] A: Not planned, no. Just unplanned, just sitting somewhere  
[20] reading it and waiting usually on doctors or something.  
[21] Q: And I take it you can't identify any of those articles  
[22] by name or author?  
[23] A: Well, it would be like the magazines like at Wal-Mart  
[24] and the grocery store. You're reading like People,  
[25] something like that, on the arguments. You are just

Page 23

[1] going in through reading it.  
[2] Like there was one in National Geographic, of  
[3] course, I know I read. It is science, you know,  
[4] articles in these books that are, you know, nonfiction.  
[5] You are sitting in waiting areas waiting like for my mom  
[6] or my dad. He has had a lot of medical problems.  
[7] I just pick up and start reading because I am  
[8] bored. You want to get your mind off of what it is on.  
[9] My dad had prostate cancer. I now there was one in  
[10] Philadelphia I ready actually. He went to a hospital  
[11] there for like 150 treatments of chemotherapy.  
[12] I was reading there. I was sitting there reading,  
[13] and I know the one was National Geographic. One was  
[14] People. On going articles written by scientists or just  
[15] reporters about this that I just read to pass the time.  
[16] Q: Did anyone give you any information — written  
[17] information to assist you in your capacity as a Board  
[18] member to decide how to vote on the resolution?  
[19] A: Not that I really remember.  
[20] Q: When the issue arose in Dover, did you try and gather  
[21] any information yourself at that time to educate  
[22] yourself about it?  
[23] A: No, I didn't.  
[24] Q: Are you familiar with the book Of Pandas and People?  
[25] A: Yes.

Page 24

[1] Q: Did you read the book or any part of book prior to  
[2] voting on the resolution?  
[3] A: Yes.  
[4] Q: When did you do that?  
[5] A: Well, I asked Casey Brown and Jeff Brown for their  
[6] copies and read it.  
[7] Q: And when did that occur in relation to the October 18th  
[8] meeting when the vote occurred?  
[9] A: It was before, during and after. I didn't read it all  
[10] at one sitting. Pieces of it.  
[11] Q: The question I am going to ask is not meant to be  
[12] condescending because it is hard for me to understand,  
[13] but did you understand this book when you read it?  
[14] A: No.  
[15] Q: Did anyone make any kind of presentation on Intelligent  
[16] Design to the Board as a whole before the vote?  
[17] A: We just talked about it between yourselves. I don't  
[18] think there was anything formal, no.  
[19] Q: So nobody outside the Board came in and said here is  
[20] what Intelligent Design is?  
[21] A: No.  
[22] Q: Did anyone — any of the Board members give — share  
[23] their understanding of what Intelligent Design is in any  
[24] kind of conversations?  
[25] A: Probably, but I don't remember it anymore. I mean they



Page 25

[1] would talk about it.

[2] Q: They, anybody in specific?

[3] A: Mostly Alan and Bill. Sometimes Heather would add  
[4] something. Mostly, the couple of them. It wasn't  
[5] everybody that I remember. Sometimes, Noel would make a  
[6] comment or to.

[7] I think Jeff and Casey were mostly just mad about  
[8] everything. And I sort — I have always sort of been  
[9] like I am now, running for Board out there with my own  
[10] little thing. You know, I didn't really get into it.

[11] Q: Did anybody on the Board express their understanding of  
[12] who the intelligent designer is?

[13] A: Yes, God.

[14] Q: Did somebody express that to you?

[15] A: Yeah.

[16] Q: Who did that?

[17] A: Alan and Bill.

[18] Q: And did that happen during Board meetings or in just  
[19] sort of private conversations?

[20] A: All of it. Board meetings and executive session and  
[21] conversations, just talk. Just very informal  
[22] discussion.

[23] Q: They actually said the intelligent designer is God?

[24] A: Alan would just say that God has been good to him, that  
[25] he has a lot to be thankful for. That this is giving

Page 26

[1] something back. And Bill just says the same thing.  
[2] Like he has been through a lot, you know.

[3] Q: I just want to I —

[4] A: He is trying to be a good Christian.

[5] Q: I want to clarify sort of how they expressed themselves.  
[6] If you can let me finish the issue the question, did any  
[7] Board member actually say anything to the effect of my  
[8] understanding is that the intelligent designer is God?

[9] A: I wouldn't say in those words, no, not like that.

[10] Q: Tell me — and I realize you may not be able to repeat  
[11] the conversation word for word, but tell me your  
[12] recollection of how Mr. Buckingham expressed his  
[13] understanding of Intelligent Design in a way that made  
[14] you think he understood it to be God. Give me your  
[15] summary of how he expressed himself.

[16] A: I think that it's because Bill was shot as a cop and  
[17] pushed off a second balcony by prisoners, that, you  
[18] know, I guess he's lucky to be alive. He just feels he  
[19] owes a lot to God. That is my take on it.

[20] Q: Did he ever express anything about Intelligent Design in  
[21] relationship to what he owes to God? I want to try and  
[22] connection, make sure if there is a connection.

[23] A: That is what I thought it was about. That is my  
[24] opinion, yeah.

[25] Q: But did Mr. Buckingham say anything that led you to hold

Page 27

[1] that opinion or have that understanding that he thought  
[2] putting Intelligent Design in the school was a service  
[3] to God?

[4] A: Well, yeah. I mean you can obviously tell by did  
[5] someone die on the cross two thousand years ago, he is  
[6] not yelling at me, he is yelling at Jeff, but I just  
[7] take that as what it means.

[8] I didn't really get into any religious  
[9] conversations because I know that Alan and Bill are way  
[10] religious, and I'm not like that. I don't go out  
[11] telling everybody about things. I don't feel  
[12] comfortable doing that.

[13] Q: Other than the two thousand years ago statement, is  
[14] there anything else Mr. Buckingham said which led you to  
[15] understand that he was connecting Intelligent Design to  
[16] religion or God?

[17] A: Probably lots of stuff, yes, but I can't really sit her  
[18] like a book and tell you. I don't remember anymore. It  
[19] just always went on. But, you know, it is just general  
[20] talk. It is not really like arguments or anything I had  
[21] with him.

[22] Q: I am asking you the same kind of question for  
[23] Mr. Bonsell. Was there anything he said that led you to  
[24] understand that he was connecting Intelligent Design to  
[25] religion or God?

Page 28

[1] A: Well, he is not like Bill. I mean he says things like  
[2] God has been really good to him, and they have a lot,  
[3] and he should be thankful. But he is not saying I  
[4] should be thankful. He is saying he should be thankful.  
[5] He doesn't push it on me.

[6] Q: Did he say that in relation to the Intelligent Design  
[7] vote?

[8] A: I don't know. I mean it's always talk. I just can't  
[9] give you a specific time or date or things. I never  
[10] argued with Alan ever until now about this. This is the  
[11] first argument Alan and I have had in five years of  
[12] working on these Boards.

[13] Q: Did anyone attempt to persuade you how to vote on the  
[14] resolution?

[15] A: Yeah, Bill.

[16] Q: And when he attempted to persuade you to vote, what did  
[17] he say?

[18] A: He just asked me to vote his way, lobbying, you know,  
[19] like you do with Board members. Can you help me out?  
[20] Can you just stick in with me? He sees me bail and he  
[21] asks me to just hang in there and try to help him out.

[22] I get a little bit antsy with things. He knows  
[23] that. Because I think there is a lot of people that  
[24] don't like it, voters, constituents, people who don't  
[25] believe in God, people who believe in different

Page 29

[1] religions. I feel the pressure, you know. So he could  
[2] see that I am pulling away. I try to help him with what  
[3] I could do, you know, without thinking I'm offending a  
[4] bunch of people.

[5] Q: I am going to mark an exhibit.

[6] MR. ROTHSCCHILD: Off the record, please.

[7] AFTER RECESS

[8] (Plaintiffs Deposition Exhibit 52 was marked.)

[9] BY MR. ROTHSCCHILD:

[10] Q: Ms. Yingling, I was asking about the October 18th  
[11] meeting, and the court reporter has handed you Exhibit  
[12] 52 which is an article by Joseph Maldonado dated  
[13] December 7th, 2004 titled "Dover Area Loses An Official,  
[14] Again."

[15] I would like you to read that, and then I will ask  
[16] you some followup questions about the article.

[17] A: (Witness complies.)

[18] Q: Are you through?

[19] A: Yes.

[20] Q: Have you seen this article before today?

[21] A: Yes.

[22] Q: I guess in seven paragraph down on the first page, the  
[23] article reports that she, referring to you, regrets  
[24] voting October 18th to add Intelligent Design to the  
[25] student curriculum, but she said she did so because many

Page 30

[1] on the Board pressured her by accusing her of being an  
[2] atheist and unChristian.

[3] Does that paragraph accurately reflect why you  
[4] voted for the October 18th resolution?

[5] A: I think the reason I voted for it was I'm trying to help  
[6] Bill out. That is why I voted for it because he asked  
[7] me to.

[8] Q: Is it accurate that individuals on the Board pressured  
[9] you by accusing you of being an atheist and unChristian?

[10] A: I think there were comments made to me, Jeff and Casey  
[11] if you don't along with it, you are not a very Christian  
[12] person, yes.

[13] Q: Who made those comments?

[14] A: Mostly Bill.

[15] Q: The article says that many on the Board. Let me  
[16] withdraw that.

[17] A: It can't be many.

[18] Q: Let me withdraw that for a moment. Did Bill make those  
[19] kind of remarks to you before the vote?

[20] A: Yeah.

[21] Q: That is a yes?

[22] A: Yes. Mostly Bill, yes.

[23] Q: Was there anybody else on the Board who made comments to  
[24] you to that effect?

[25] A: It wouldn't be direct comments. It wouldn't be relevant

Page 31

[1] to this, you know, no.

[2] Q: Did anybody on the Board make similar comments to you in  
[3] other contexts?

[4] A: Well, I think that I probably was too sensitive with  
[5] some of the comments that were made, yes.

[6] Q: But you do recall that Mr. Buckingham did suggest you  
[7] would be unChristian if you didn't vote for the  
[8] resolution?

[9] A: Absolutely, yes.

[10] Q: How did you respond to that?

[11] A: I usually respond the same way. How can you ask me that  
[12] question when you know that my husband died so young and  
[13] watching him die? I don't even probably give them the  
[14] answer they want, you know.

[15] Q: Did any other members of the Board who voted for the  
[16] resolution tell you why they voted that way?

[17] A: Probably.

[18] Q: Can you remember any of those conversations?

[19] A: They were just general conversations, you know, nothing  
[20] that was real — I wasn't arguing with any of them over  
[21] it. I mean just they did what they thought was the  
[22] right thing to do.

[23] Q: For example, do you remember Mrs. Geesey saying why she  
[24] vote for it?

[25] A: Yes, she is very religious.

Page 32

[1] Q: Did she say she voted for it because she was religious?

[2] A: Because she is a Christian.

[3] Q: She said that?

[4] A: Yeah.

[5] Q: What about Ms. Cleaver, did she say why?

[6] A: Yes. Jane is very, very religious, very much.

[7] Q: I just want to be clear. I want to distinguish between  
[8] the fact that she is religious and whether she said I am  
[9] voting for it because I am a Christian or I am  
[10] religious. Did she say that?

[11] A: Janie and I had, you know, just private little  
[12] conversations that were just very nice all the time.  
[13] Janie is very is sophisticated and very well-spoken, you  
[14] know.

[15] She believes that this is a good way to go with  
[16] kids who are bad and kids who do horrible things like  
[17] murder and, you know, rape and kill their fellow  
[18] classmates. I mean that it would bring some type of  
[19] behavior into the classroom that would be better.

[20] Q: And she said that was a reason she was voting for this?

[21] A: Yes.

[22] Q: Did she ever say I am voting for this because I am a  
[23] Christian?

[24] A: Not to those kind of words, no.

[25] Q: Anything else that she —

Page 33

[1] A: She would say she is a Christian, but not in this stuff.  
[2] Q: That is exactly what I am trying to clarify.  
[3] A: Yeah.  
[4] Q: I understand that members of the Board — or some of  
[5] them are religious?  
[6] A: Very.  
[7] Q: And that you may infer that their voting a certain way  
[8] because they are religious, but I am really asking you  
[9] about the things they have said. Okay?  
[10] So sticking with Ms. Cleaver, you talked about how  
[11] she —  
[12] A: My personal pressure doesn't come from Janie, no.  
[13] Q: I am not asking about your pressure. I am asking  
[14] whether Ms. Cleaver ever said I am voting for the  
[15] resolution because and said what the because was?  
[16] A: Probably did, yeah.  
[17] Q: I think you mentioned some of what she said was it will  
[18] help bad kids?  
[19] A: Right, the really bad children who do really bad things  
[20] like murder.  
[21] Q: Did she explain why she thought the resolution about  
[22] Intelligent Design would help in that way?  
[23] A: Sure. To try to get them on the right path because they  
[24] are on the path to doing these dreadful things, yeah.  
[25] Q: Is that something she said?

Page 34

[1] A: Yeah.  
[2] Q: What about Ms. Geesey, can you recall anything she said  
[3] about why she voted for the resolution?  
[4] A: Just the right thing to do. I know she said that. She  
[5] believes she's doing the right thing, and this is the  
[6] way to go. Just general comments, you know. I would  
[7] say yeah, I see your point about it.  
[8] Q: Did there come a time when you changed your mind about  
[9] how you had voted on the biology curriculum?  
[10] A: Yes.  
[11] Q: Do you remember when that occurred? If the vote was  
[12] October 18th, when did you come to the conclusion you  
[13] might have made a mistake in your vote?  
[14] A: Well, just as there is also a lot of pressure on what  
[15] you're doing to the community and how we are going to  
[16] pay for all of it. People have different ideas and  
[17] opinions and beliefs, yes. There was pressure.  
[18] Q: There was pressure, but did you come to any — why did  
[19] you decide it was a mistake? What was wrong about the  
[20] vote?  
[21] A: The biggest thing is what you hear out of your right  
[22] ear. I am on the end. So you hear them grumbling and  
[23] complaining and whining and just right out yelling about  
[24] it, you know.  
[25] Like I said, when Alan was President, there wasn't

Page 35

[1] a lot of civility and control. He just left them yell  
[2] and scream and dance around.  
[3] There's tables and tables always on my side on the  
[4] right-hand side of disgruntled teachers and former Board  
[5] members, and I hear them because I'm on the end. I  
[6] don't think they hear them being up around the circle in  
[7] the middle, but I hear them complaining constantly what  
[8] are you doing? Are you crazy? Are you nuts? You can't  
[9] do this kind of stuff.  
[10] Q: Other than what people at the Board meeting were saying,  
[11] was there anything else that led you to the conclusion  
[12] that the vote was not a good idea?  
[13] A: Yeah. A lot of stuff.  
[14] Q: What else?  
[15] A: My dad says the religious freaks have taken over Dover.  
[16] My mom says what in the name of God are you doing? I  
[17] mean my relatives are horrified. My aunt thinks it's a  
[18] bunch of idiots running the Board.  
[19] I mean the comments from neighbors. They stop me,  
[20] and they won't let me pass in the middle of the street.  
[21] Dr. Troxell stands in front of my vehicle and says what  
[22] are you doing? Have you people lost your minds?  
[23] I mean Dr. Troxell knows. He is an administrator.  
[24] You're going to be sued big. The comments come from my  
[25] next door neighbors, my neighbors down the street, my

Page 36

[1] neighbors in the new section, my neighbors in the old  
[2] sex. It is coming from everywhere. What are you doing?  
[3] Have you lost your mind?  
[4] Mostly my dad, he says, why are you doing this?  
[5] It doesn't belong in school. I don't want to pay for  
[6] it. I'm sure nobody else wants to pay for it. You  
[7] better get off the Board.  
[8] I have a lot of pressure to resign. A lot of  
[9] pressure from Dr. Troxell, Barbie Troxell, my neighbors,  
[10] my family to resign so I am not part of this lawsuit.  
[11] MR. ROTHSCHILD: Okay. I am going to mark this as  
[12] Exhibit 53.  
[13] (Plaintiffs Deposition Exhibit 53 was marked.)  
[14] BY MR. ROTHSCHILD:  
[15] Q: Do you recognize the document we have marked as P-53?  
[16] A: Yes.  
[17] Q: What is that?  
[18] A: I just wanted them to go back and, you know, let's talk  
[19] about it, change some things, yes.  
[20] Q: Is it basically a request to the Board to —  
[21] A: It is a memo.  
[22] Q: You have to let me finish.  
[23] A: I am sorry.  
[24] Q: Is the document I have given you, P-53, a request to the  
[25] Board to reconsider the change in the biology



Page 37

Page 39

[1] curriculum?  
[2] A: Yes.  
[3] Q: And your request is — your suggestion is remove the  
[4] language that was added to the biology curriculum and go  
[5] back to the language that existed before?  
[6] A: Right.  
[7] Q: What happened to this request for the Board to  
[8] reconsider?  
[9] A: They won't do it.  
[10] Q: There never was a vote to reconsider?  
[11] A: No. Alan, the Board President, said this sets us back.  
[12] MR. ROTHSCHILD: Mark this as P-54.  
[13] (Plaintiffs Deposition Exhibit 54 was introduced.)  
[14] BY MR. ROTHSCHILD:  
[15] Q: Ms. Yingling, I have handed you P-54, which is a  
[16] December 8th, 2004 article by Joseph Maldonado titled  
[17] Board Member Says the Worst Is Coming, Angie Yingling  
[18] Offered Her Resignation Over the Intelligent Design  
[19] Controversy.  
[20] Have you seen this article before?  
[21] A: Yes, last year I believe.  
[22] Q: And it says in the article that you were unable to get a  
[23] second on a motion to revisit an October 18th curriculum  
[24] change. Do you see that in the third paragraph?  
[25] A: No. Are you on the second page?

Page 38

Page 40

[1] Q: First page, third paragraph in the paragraph that starts  
[2] Yingling offered.  
[3] A: Right, right, right.  
[4] Q: And so was that your effort to get the curriculum  
[5] reconsidered that we saw in the memo?  
[6] A: Right, yes.  
[7] Q: And further down the page, Mr. Maldonado reports that  
[8] the biggest reason she said she was unable to get a  
[9] second on her motion is because of what she said is the  
[10] influence Alan Bonsell, the Board President, has on  
[11] other Board members. Do you see that?  
[12] A: Yes.  
[13] Q: Is that something you told Mr. Maldonado?  
[14] A: Well, I believe it to be true. I don't know if I told  
[15] him that or not. I may have told someone else, and he  
[16] heard me. I don't think I told Joe. I think I was  
[17] complaining to somebody else.  
[18] Q: But the statement is an accurate report of yours?  
[19] A: That is what I think. I think Bill has influence, too.  
[20] Q: What did you mean by the influence Alan Bonsell has on  
[21] other Board members?  
[22] A: Just to do the right thing. I think Alan has a lot of  
[23] influence because him and his family are very wealthy.  
[24] He is very well-spoken. So is his dad. They are in  
[25] politics.

[1] They tell you what they think, and that you  
[2] probably should do what they think.  
[3] Q: Does Mr. Bonsell's influence in part derive from his  
[4] ability to persuade others?  
[5] A: I think he is very good at persuading others, yes.  
[6] Q: Other than persuading by argument or discussion, is  
[7] there any other way he has influence on the Board  
[8] members?  
[9] A: Well, Alan isn't like Bill. Bill likes to yell and  
[10] scream at Jeff. Alan is very well-spoken. And Alan  
[11] doesn't yell and scream to get his point across. Alan  
[12] is reasonable, and his talk is intelligent, well thought  
[13] out. He takes his time making every decision he makes.  
[14] He has the time to make decisions, unlike most of  
[15] us who have to rush with our whole life. He takes his  
[16] time, and looks at all sides. And he likes to hear what  
[17] people have to say.  
[18] I mean it is my opinion that Alan is very, very,  
[19] very — for lack of a better word — my dad calls him  
[20] whacked out religious. That is what my dad calls both  
[21] of them, him and his dad, and they are. They are real  
[22] adamant about everybody being a Christian and doing the  
[23] right thing.  
[24] There's nothing wrong with that, but it makes me  
[25] feel uncomfortable. And I should have probably said

[1] something long before this.  
[2] Q: When you use the phrase or agree with your dad's phrase  
[3] whacked out religious, what do you mean by that?  
[4] A: They are always pressuring other people to believe in  
[5] God, and be religious, and go out and tell people that  
[6] you are Christian and try to get them to come to your  
[7] church, try to get them to understand your way of  
[8] thinking. It is just religious lobbying that goes on.  
[9] Q: Did that religious lobbying occur in the context of the  
[10] Board's activities?  
[11] A: I just don't agree with that. I think that Alan makes  
[12] statements that have offended me, and I should have said  
[13] something. I have left it go for five years. I haven't  
[14] said anything. Then it builds, and it builds, and it  
[15] builds until you just snap one day. And this is my  
[16] fault. This isn't Alan's fault. This is my fault  
[17] because I wasn't honest with him.  
[18] I take offense to some things, and I have been  
[19] taking offense for a long time, and I don't — I don't  
[20] make myself clear at all.  
[21] Q: Let me go back and make sure my question is answered  
[22] which is: Did he engage in any of this what you phrased  
[23] as religious lobbying in sessions of the Board, whether  
[24] public or executive?  
[25] A: The only thing — and it is embarrassing and secretly

Page 41

[1] offends me, and it is all my problem. It is not Alan.  
[2] He will say a lot that God has been so good to him, and  
[3] God has been so good to his wife, and he should be  
[4] thankful to God.  
[5] And I don't agree with that. I think his dad and  
[6] his mom and his grandma have given him everything that  
[7] he has. He hasn't worked for it. That is not a nice  
[8] statement. It is not nice to say these things.  
[9] I mean I am being not nice. I am not being a good  
[10] friend. And I know that he thinks I am not a good  
[11] friend because he told me that. I guess I just think  
[12] that God doesn't have anything to do with it.  
[13] I think that his mom and his dad and grandma gave  
[14] him an awful lot of stuff. I personally taking offense,  
[15] and it is my problem. And I look like a jealous, bitchy  
[16] friend. And it's not what I mean to, but I take offense  
[17] to it. I have been taking offense for five years, and I  
[18] never said anything. This is all very embarrassing to  
[19] me. Do you know what I mean?  
[20] Q: Did you ultimately make a decision to resign from the  
[21] School Board?  
[22] A: Yes.  
[23] Q: Why did you do that?  
[24] A: Because I was angry with Sheila and Alan for not going  
[25] back and talking about this stuff. I am pissed off at

Page 42

[1] them.  
[2] MR. ROTHSCHILD: I have no further questions.  
[3] Thank you.  
[4] BY MR. GILLEN:  
[5] Q: Angie, I am going to have some questions. Do you want  
[6] to take a minute or so, or are you okay?  
[7] A: No. Go ahead. It is all embarrassing because these are  
[8] my friends, you know. I am sure they are disappointed  
[9] in me.  
[10] Q: Well, I understand. I think that friends can honestly  
[11] differ, and I think that is in large part of what is  
[12] going on here.  
[13] MS. HARKINS: Do you want a hug quick, Angie? I  
[14] will give you a hug.  
[15] MR. ROTHSCHILD: Off the record.  
[16] (An off-the-record discussion was had.)  
[17] BY MR. GILLEN:  
[18] Q: Angie, my name is Pat Gillen. We have also met off the  
[19] record, but I want to let you know again as I begin  
[20] asking you a few questions that I represent the School  
[21] Board.  
[22] And Mr. Rothstein, Eric — Rothschild, forgive me  
[23] — has asked you a number of questions. I am trying to  
[24] get a little more detail about some of the events that  
[25] you recounted.

Page 43

[1] Let me ask you: Prior to the June, 2004 Board  
[2] meetings which we have discussed here, was there any  
[3] time at which the biology text or biology curriculum  
[4] came to your attention?  
[5] A: Well, there were several comments about changes and  
[6] things, not really into specific arguments in anything  
[7] like there is now. Just random.  
[8] Q: So if we look back at that period, which begins say  
[9] January of 2004 and ends at the end of May, 2004, do you  
[10] recall any discussion of the biology text or biology  
[11] curriculum during that period?  
[12] A: Well, yeah. Alan was in charge of curriculum, and Bill  
[13] was on it, too, and Heather, just reviewing things, just  
[14] general statements about reviewing biology. It's been  
[15] going on for some time.  
[16] I never wanted curriculum so I wasn't too much  
[17] involved. Mostly budget and other things. I go to  
[18] other schools. That is my thing, not curriculum.  
[19] Q: Okay. Do you recall what that discussion was about?  
[20] A: Just that the curriculum committee wanted to change some  
[21] things. They wouldn't even elaborate. Not that I  
[22] remember.  
[23] Q: Do you recall any discussion of the biology text not  
[24] being balanced?  
[25] A: Yeah.

Page 44

[1] Q: Do you recall any discussion of either Alan or Bill  
[2] saying we want other scientific theories to be  
[3] discussed?  
[4] A: Right, right. It wasn't Heather. It was Alan and Bill.  
[5] They would like to have some other ideas. But they  
[6] didn't go into anything. It was never anything past  
[7] some changes and some balancing. That would be the end  
[8] of the words that I remember, but I never was invited to  
[9] these meetings. I am not on that committee. I have  
[10] plenty of committees on my own.  
[11] Q: I do understand that. I know you weren't on the  
[12] curriculum committee.  
[13] Do you recall — again, we are looking at this  
[14] period January through the end of May of 2004, any  
[15] discussion of Intelligent Design?  
[16] A: Not with me, no.  
[17] Q: Do you recall hearing the term during that period?  
[18] A: Yeah. Just hearing it, but it never was directed at me,  
[19] no.  
[20] Q: Do you recall any of the teachers appearing at any Board  
[21] meetings between the period January, 2004 and up until  
[22] the end of May, not at June yet, up until the end of May  
[23] to discuss the biology text?  
[24] A: I think it was Bert Spahr who is in charge of the whole  
[25] Science Department. I had her.

Page 45

Page 47

[1] Q: Do you recall anything she said during that period?  
[2] A: Bert is always complaining about everything. All she  
[3] ever does is complain. I mean I had her for three  
[4] grades. You know.  
[5] She is — boy, I don't care for her. I had her as  
[6] a student so I really dislike her. That's all I can say  
[7] about her. I remember she complains all the time. So  
[8] because she is constantly complaining, I turn a deaf ear  
[9] to her. I don't pay attention because I am just so used  
[10] to it.  
[11] Q: Okay.  
[12] A: She complains all the time.  
[13] Q: Just give me an idea what you mean about that.  
[14] A: She is always bitching all the time. All she does is  
[15] bitch constantly. So I just don't listen to her.  
[16] Q: I do understand how people can turn you off.  
[17] A: Yes, I don't even hear her. I just see her mouth  
[18] moving, and I write or read. I do. I don't pay  
[19] attention at all. I have the ability to turn her off.  
[20] I think it comes from 27 years in food and  
[21] beverage. You just turn off all the tremendous noise  
[22] around you, and just go into your own menus and  
[23] everything that you need to do. I just completely turn  
[24] her off. I see her mouth moving, but I don't hear a  
[25] word she says.

Page 46

[1] Q: Right. Let's focus on the June meetings. And, again, I  
[2] want to ask you: Do you recall during these June  
[3] meetings Bill Buckingham discussing the text in terms of  
[4] balance?  
[5] A: Yes.  
[6] Q: And do you recall the discussion of Intelligent Design  
[7] from Bill Buckingham saying we need another scientific  
[8] theory?  
[9] A: Yes.  
[10] Q: And let me ask you specifically: When he was saying  
[11] scientific theory, did he mention Intelligent Design in  
[12] connection with that?  
[13] MR. ROTHSCHILD: Objection. Lacks foundation and  
[14] leading.  
[15] A: I can't remember. It is almost a year ago. I can't  
[16] remember any more.  
[17] BY MR. GILLEN:  
[18] Q: When he mentioned Intelligent Design at that time, did  
[19] he mention the text Of Pandas?  
[20] MR. ROTHSCHILD: Objection. I would like an  
[21] objection to this whole line as leading.  
[22] A: I can't remember. I don't know. I might not have been  
[23] paying too close of attention.  
[24] BY MR. GILLEN:  
[25] Q: I understand. That is fine.

[1] A: I am so involved in all my own committees that I just  
[2] can't recall anyway.  
[3] Q: Okay. I know you have said that Mr. Buckingham used the  
[4] term Creationism at a certain time. And you have also  
[5] said that the meetings were very — how shall I say it  
[6] — there was a great deal of comment from the public  
[7] section; is that correct?  
[8] A: Yeah. They are always, yeah.  
[9] Q: Do you recall whether Mr. Buckingham used the term  
[10] Creationism in response to comments from the public?  
[11] A: I don't really remember. I know it is always something  
[12] going on up there. I mean it is very clear that the  
[13] teachers don't like the current Board. I mean it is  
[14] always the same group of teachers and the same  
[15] disgruntled Board members who resigned sitting there  
[16] complaining.  
[17] It's again, it is just like Bert Spahr, you are  
[18] just used to the constant complaining all the time.  
[19] They find fault with everything we do. And that's why  
[20] they are there.  
[21] Q: Let me ask you do you recall Barrie Callahan being at  
[22] Board meetings in June?  
[23] A: Oh, yeah. She is always up there whining about  
[24] something. Again, I turn my ear to her, too. I turn a  
[25] deaf ear because she is always at the podium

Page 48

[1] complaining.  
[2] Nothing suits her. She was voted out. And, of  
[3] course, that's all our faults, like it wouldn't be the  
[4] voters faults. So she would be whining about something  
[5] all the time.  
[6] Again, I don't listen to her and just sort of read  
[7] or write or do something else.  
[8] Q: Do you not listen to her because you think that she is  
[9] politically motivated?  
[10] A: Yes.  
[11] MR. ROTHSCHILD: Objection, leading.  
[12] BY MR. GILLEN:  
[13] Q: Do you recall whether Barrie Callahan made statements to  
[14] Bill Buckingham about Intelligent Design being  
[15] Creationism?  
[16] A: Yes. And they fight a lot.  
[17] MR. ROTHSCHILD: Objection, leading.  
[18] MR. GILLEN: I am just asking her what she  
[19] remembers.  
[20] MR. ROTHSCHILD: You are not asking her what Ms.  
[21] Callahan, what she said on the subject. You are leading  
[22] with giving her the content.  
[23] BY MR. GILLEN:  
[24] Q: Do you recall whether Ms. Callahan accused Bill  
[25] Buckingham of wanting to teach Creationism?

Page 49

[1] A: I think she did.  
[2] Q: Now when Mrs. Callahan made that accusation, did you  
[3] credit it or turn a deaf ear to it?  
[4] A: I never listen to her. I just ignore her.  
[5] Q: What was your understanding of what Bill wanted in the  
[6] biology classroom?  
[7] A: I think Bill —  
[8] MR. ROTHSCHILD: I am sorry. Are we talking about  
[9] a specific time period?

[10] BY MR. GILLEN:

[11] Q: At the June meetings. I am sorry if I was unclear. I  
[12] am talking about the June meetings. What I am asking  
[13] is —  
[14] A: He just wants this program of Intelligent Design brought  
[15] forward.  
[16] Q: Do you recall Alan Bonsell discussing Intelligent Design  
[17] during the June Board meetings?  
[18] A: I think he was trying to shut up Barrie Callahan, but  
[19] nothing works. I think he was gaveling her down or  
[20] something, but nothing works. She just keeps screaming.  
[21] The meetings were really out of control when Alan  
[22] was President. Community members would complain about  
[23] it, and people to me. It was true. Callahan would  
[24] always be up there yelling all the time every meeting.  
[25] Q: And am I accurate that one of the things she was yelling

Page 50

[1] is you are trying to teach Creationism?  
[2] A: I believe she yelled that I think leaving. They would  
[3] finally gavel — Alan would keep beating the hammer,  
[4] gavel her down. She would go back yelling the whole way  
[5] back to her usual round table seat. She would be  
[6] yelling it th whole way. She would keep on talking.  
[7] She wouldn't shut up and just keeps on going all the way  
[8] back. She just won't shut up.  
[9] Q: Let me ask you: At any time during these June meetings  
[10] with this uproar, did any of the Board members tell you  
[11] we want Creationism taught in Dover?  
[12] A: I just — I don't really think in those words like that.  
[13] I mean all I remember is when the shit hit the fan.  
[14] That is all I remember, when Bill and Jeff are always  
[15] arguing. And that is it, when Bill yells at me.  
[16] I don't really remember them saying it like that  
[17] or anything. It's just undercurrent and talk that  
[18] wouldn't be like that. They're just talking between  
[19] themselves.  
[20] Like in executive session, it's not really said  
[21] like that. It's more like, you know, like with Alan and  
[22] Bill, they want to present different theories. That is  
[23] how it goes. It doesn't really go like that.  
[24] They just want to present different theories to  
[25] the kids. I just sort of sit there and agree, you know.

Page 51

[1] I think you can give them too much education. I think  
[2] we do throw too much at them sometimes as far as  
[3] pressure and too much to read. That's how I felt.  
[4] But I mean it is mostly college level, and this  
[5] book is college level. It's just general talk. It  
[6] wasn't really anything specific that I can remember.  
[7] And, again, you are going back almost a year.  
[8] I remember Callahan always up there yelling. And  
[9] Bert Spahr, she's always complaining. People just keep  
[10] complaining all the time.  
[11] You as a Board member who don't share their views  
[12] sort of sit there and zone, like my assistant does, just  
[13] go somewhere else, you know.  
[14] Q: I do understand that.  
[15] A: It's all pretty boring to me because I am not a science  
[16] major. I like business administration, mathematics.  
[17] This is not my thing at all. This is more the other  
[18] Board members thing. It is not mine. I never really  
[19] liked science.  
[20] Again, I guess that's my opinion I had already  
[21] formed on Bert Spahr because of science, having her so  
[22] much. I had to have it to get into college. Your  
[23] counselor tells you what you have to do to get there.  
[24] It's just the ways and means of getting that degree that  
[25] you want.

Page 52

[1] So you know, I think it is kind of bad when Board  
[2] members are students.  
[3] Q: Well, you have mentioned that during the Board meetings,  
[4] there was this discussion Alan and Bill want different  
[5] theories?  
[6] A: Yeah.  
[7] Q: And what I am trying to understand is are the theories  
[8] in play here on the one hand Evolution and on the other  
[9] hand Intelligent Design?  
[10] A: I think so.  
[11] MR. ROTHSCHILD: Objection, leading. Just the  
[12] June time period?  
[13] BY MR. GILLEN:  
[14] Q: It is the June time period.  
[15] A: Yeah. I think so, yeah.  
[16] Q: Do you remember anyone else from the public speaking  
[17] during the June, 2004 Board meeting?  
[18] A: It's always the usual. Mr. Snook — it is the Board  
[19] members that resigned, Lonnie Langione and the ones that  
[20] are mad. They are all very upset they were voted out or  
[21] they quit. When they walk off, they are pissed. They  
[22] still are.  
[23] They are launching a big campaign against the  
[24] Board. I am not even in on it; I am on my own. But  
[25] with the Browns, of course.



Page 53

Page 55

(1) Yes, it is always Mr. Snook. It is always Lonnie  
(2) Langione. It is always Barrie Callahan. It is always  
(3) the same exact people every meeting up at the podium  
(4) yelling. So that is why I tend not to listen to them.  
(5) Q: Okay. Any other teachers that came to the podium during  
(6) the June meeting?  
(7) A: The one with the tight pants. I can't think of her  
(8) name. She is young and has very tight pants. She's a  
(9) ninth grade teacher.  
(10) Jen, Jen, that's the one. Jen with tight pants,  
(11) yeah.  
(12) Q: Can you recall any of the statements that she made?  
(13) A: She is not happy about it either. When the teachers are  
(14) there, they are not happy. They don't come to the Board  
(15) to tell you hey, you're doing a great job. They come to  
(16) complain.  
(17) There's only one reason teachers are there, that  
(18) is to complain. That is the only reason they show up.  
(19) They all sit in their little circles and talk about is.  
(20) The problem is I can hear them because I am on the end.  
(21) So I hear them constantly bitching about us. Yeah, that  
(22) was the one with tight pants.  
(23) Q: Tell me what you can about the thrust of Jen Miller's  
(24) comments at the June, 2004 Board meetings.  
(25) A: She didn't want it. She's being jacked up by Bert

(1) Q: Let me ask you, Angie, when you heard the teachers up  
(2) there at the podium in June leveling their complaints  
(3) against the Board —  
(4) A: Yeah, yeah.  
(5) Q: — were you disposed to give them credit, or did you  
(6) think their complaints were about other things?  
(7) A: They bitch so much I don't give them merit for much of  
(8) anything. That is how I feel about them. All they ever  
(9) do is complain about everything.  
(10) I mean nothing suits them. If you gave them the  
(11) world, they would bitch because there isn't a fence  
(12) around it. That's how I feel about them as a whole.  
(13) That is just how I think about them. All they do  
(14) is complain constantly. I have never seen so much  
(15) complaining, never. And they are always unhappy.  
(16) Q: If we go to the August meeting where the textbook comes  
(17) up, as Eric mentioned, initially you vote with Bill?  
(18) A: Right.  
(19) Q: As I believe you said that was to tie the approval of  
(20) the text Of Pandas to approval of the text Biology by  
(21) Miller and Levin; is that correct?  
(22) A: Yes.  
(23) Q: You mentioned that you had looked at the text Of Pandas  
(24) sort of before, during and after —  
(25) A: Right.

Page 54

Page 56

(1) Spahr. Bert Spahr is behind all of it, of course.  
(2) Q: When you say she didn't want it, do you mean —  
(3) MR. ROTHSCHILD: Objection, leading.  
(4) A: She doesn't want the whole thing. Intelligent Design,  
(5) she doesn't want it. They all don't want it, the  
(6) teachers.  
(7) BY MR. GILLEN:  
(8) Q: Have they ever told you why?  
(9) A: Not me, because I don't talk to them. I mean they don't  
(10) like me, and I don't like them. I mean it is pretty  
(11) obvious that they hate the Board. I don't get into it  
(12) with them.  
(13) I mean I don't think I ever had a conversation  
(14) with any of them. Of course, the ones that had me know  
(15) who I am because I use Zeigler as a middle name. They  
(16) remember me. I mean I always got straight A's in  
(17) everything, but I don't think they like us on the Board.  
(18) I mean they pretty much make that pretty clear.  
(19) The ones that are on their way out like Bert Spahr  
(20) make it really clear because they are just going to  
(21) retire. She has been there like forever. It's time for  
(22) some of them to really get out.  
(23) That is how I feel, especially the ones I had that  
(24) were terrible. Like I said, it is bad when the students  
(25) come back as Board members.

(1) Q: — these votes?  
(2) A: Yes.  
(3) MR. ROTHSCHILD: Objection, lacks foundation.  
(4) BY MR. GILLEN:  
(5) Q: Is it safe to say when this vote came up in August, you  
(6) had at least looked at it before that time?  
(7) A: Yeah.  
(8) Q: When you looked at it, and Eric asked you, he said it's  
(9) difficult to read, did you have an opinion concerning  
(10) whether that was as some teachers said teaching  
(11) Creationism?  
(12) A: Yeah.  
(13) Q: What was that?  
(14) A: I think it's difficult to read. And it is to a point,  
(15) yeah, I agree.  
(16) Q: It is what?  
(17) A: Teaching Creationism.  
(18) Q: Why do you say that?  
(19) A: Well, it is the creator, like the inference is God.  
(20) That is how I take it, you know. It's my opinion.  
(21) Q: I want to get that as precisely as I can. You said that  
(22) is an inference?  
(23) A: Right. That is how I interpret it. I don't know if all  
(24) the kids are going to, but that is how I take it as an  
(25) adult way out of school.



Page 57

[1] Q: And I understand that. Was there anything in the text  
[2] that led you to believe or that stated —

[3] A: Yeah.

[4] Q: What?

[5] A: You will have to give it to me. I would have to go  
[6] through it. It has been so long now. I will have to  
[7] see the book and go through it to tell you the piece.

[8] Q: Just tell me your recollection of the text. In other  
[9] words, I understand you have made an inference?

[10] A: Yeah. That's how I view it. I mean it is to deal with  
[11] some religion I think, some religious background in  
[12] teaching of it, which is fine if it is not offending a  
[13] bunch of people, but unfortunately it is. That is how I  
[14] look at it.

[15] They are mad about it because you are pushing  
[16] religion down their kids throats. That is how they  
[17] feel. That is what they tell me at least in person  
[18] about the book. And, you know, I got to agree to a  
[19] point. Some of it is poorly written. That may be in  
[20] conjunction with hard to understand. It is typical  
[21] college level textbook, you know, and not appropriate.

[22] That is what Barrie is always yelling, not  
[23] appropriate. But again, the ones that complain all the  
[24] time, you tend to turn a deaf ear to them. That is what  
[25] they are doing, they are always complaining.

Page 58

[1] Q: And that is what I am trying to understand. I realize  
[2] initially, you voted to tie the approval of the two  
[3] texts together?

[4] A: Right. It is kind of blackmailing, just like Jeff said.  
[5] I mean that is Bill's point. In other words, if you  
[6] give me — it's just politics. That's all. Give me  
[7] what I want, and I will give you what you want.

[8] How about giving me a little bit here, or I am  
[9] going to tie you up so I am going to force you to give  
[10] me what I want. That's all.

[11] Q: And then you said you switched your vote?

[12] A: Yes.

[13] Q: And I want to understand why. It seems to me you have  
[14] said there was a public outcry.

[15] A: Yeah. I can hear them. Especially with my right ear,  
[16] you can hear them just constantly complaining. It was  
[17] like outrage. Like what are you doing? You can't do  
[18] this without talking about it.

[19] Everybody thinks like — I mean you have got to  
[20] understand. They just don't think that we talk about  
[21] things enough, that we don't have public involvement or  
[22] public meetings or public open communication, open  
[23] forums, and I do think we need more of that. I do think  
[24] it is a shortcoming. I am right involved with it anyway  
[25] because I was on the Board four years.

Page 59

[1] You have got to go out more in the community and  
[2] see what they think, and take polls, and have some focus  
[3] groups. I can hear them yelling in my right ear. It is  
[4] too speedy of a decision.

[5] I am thinking we didn't spend a lot of time on  
[6] something that is so important. Maybe we should go back  
[7] and look at it again. That is just what I think. But,  
[8] of course, it comes from public urging too and yelling  
[9] and complaining, and not from just these, you know — in  
[10] my mind, it is four tables, big round tables of  
[11] complainers.

[12] But then you might have ten other tables of people  
[13] who don't always habitually sit there and complain.  
[14] Those are the ones that have more influence on me than  
[15] the four tables of constant complainers they show up at  
[16] every planning session and every Board session you have  
[17] that up there.

[18] You have the two and two, the two teachers tables,  
[19] and then you have the constant Board members who quit  
[20] and their disgruntled group. And then add in more  
[21] disgruntled taxpayers and groups around the disgruntled  
[22] Board members who all walked off. That is because of  
[23] the election and everything.

[24] Q: Was there any additional discussion about the book  
[25] itself before you decided to switch the vote, or you

Page 60

[1] heard the outcry and you said —

[2] A: I was surprised at how loud it was and how much  
[3] complaining they were doing. It was really bad. Things  
[4] don't regularly get so bad at Dover. There's always  
[5] something wrong, but this was pretty good sized.

[6] Q: Are you basically —

[7] A: And some unusual people complaining that normally don't.  
[8] That's what influences me. When they are not always up  
[9] there yelling about something, I tend to listen to them  
[10] more.

[11] Q: So the differing source of the complaints gave them more  
[12] credence?

[13] A: Absolutely, yeah.

[14] Q: Can you recall was there anyone specifically who spoke  
[15] at the meeting?

[16] A: Just the usual complainers. They are always up there.

[17] Q: So it was more the volume?

[18] A: Yeah, and different voices. Not your usual voices that  
[19] you know who they are without even looking. Like I know  
[20] Mr. Snook, and I know Mrs. Callahan without even  
[21] looking. Their voices are so distinctive and loud that  
[22] you know who they are without even looking at them. I  
[23] know who is back there complaining.

[24] Then, of course, the teachers, you know.

[25] Q: If we look at the period between the vote on the text in

Page 61

Page 63

[1] August of 2004 and then the curriculum change vote which  
[2] is October 18th, 2004 —

[3] A: Right.

[4] Q: — I just want to get a sense for whether you were  
[5] involved. You've told me I wasn't on the curriculum  
[6] committee and so on.

[7] Did you have discussions with Board members during  
[8] that period about a contemplated curriculum change?

[9] A: Anything would just be like personal conversations. It  
[10] wasn't anything in a group meeting or anything. Just  
[11] like on the way out of the executive session or  
[12] privately, you know, just in the hallway, in a corner or  
[13] anywhere.

[14] You see them everywhere in Dover, grocery store,  
[15] whatnot. You just run into them, or they are talking  
[16] about their own problems, and it comes up. Just their  
[17] car problems and stuff because I just sort of do  
[18] administration book work at a small repair service.  
[19] Just stuff like that. It wasn't anything formal.

[20] Q: Can you recall any of those discussions between August  
[21] and October about?

[22] A: Probably it would be a good idea. It usually comes from  
[23] Alan or Bill. Just voting their way would be good.  
[24] They are just lobbying but not forcefully or anything,  
[25] just little comments. It doesn't mean much. It is just

[1] A: He is not well. His back is not well at all. He's  
[2] having constant problems with his back, the cage, the  
[3] wire cage in his back.

[4] Q: I do understand.

[5] A: Yeah. I try not to fight with him like Mr. Brown does  
[6] because I don't think Bill is well. I don't want to  
[7] fight with people who are sick. You wouldn't go to a  
[8] rest home and fight with people there. I just try not  
[9] to get into it.

[10] Q: And did you have any discussions about your vote switch  
[11] after —

[12] A: Yeah.

[13] Q: Let's look at that. Eric has asked you about some  
[14] quotes in the paper. Did you have any other discussions  
[15] with Bill about the vote switch?

[16] A: Yeah.

[17] Q: Just tell me. What did he say?

[18] A: Bill was upset with me. I have disappointed him. And  
[19] he wants me to vote his way, just to hang in there, try  
[20] and see his way. Politics is just lobbying like  
[21] everybody does.

[22] If you really want something and your gang isn't  
[23] seeing your way or you need five votes from the table,  
[24] just to see his way. Can I hang in there? Can I vote  
[25] like he wants?

Page 62

Page 64

[1] ordinary talk that you might do, plus ten other things.  
[2] You are talking about everything at once. It is not  
[3] centered on that.

[4] Q: I do understand. It is sort of a passing conversation?

[5] A: Yes. Just fleeting moment. I knew they wanted to get  
[6] things changed. I just didn't know it was going to be  
[7] this bad.

[8] Q: By this bad, this controversial?

[9] A: Yeah.

[10] Q: How about looking at the same period of August after the  
[11] vote approving the teacher recommended text Biology and  
[12] the October 18th, 2004 meeting on the curriculum change,  
[13] any discussion of Of Pandas?

[14] A: I think it was, yeah.

[15] Q: There was?

[16] A: Yes.

[17] Q: Can you recall who you had those discussions with?

[18] A: I think it was Bill. Just about the book. He thought  
[19] it was a good idea. I didn't say too much in my  
[20] truthful — the way I thought. You know. The book is  
[21] kind of a little bit weird. I didn't say that, but I  
[22] thought it.

[23] But I didn't want to upset him because he has  
[24] enough problems. I didn't want to upset him.

[25] Q: Okay.

[1] Q: And when you say vote like he wants, what did you  
[2] understand?

[3] A: He wants Intelligent Design, you know, more ideas and  
[4] theories thrown out to the kids.

[5] Q: We get to the October meeting. And as you know, there  
[6] were a couple of versions of curriculum changes in front  
[7] of you?

[8] A: Yeah.

[9] Q: Do you recall discussion relating to those changes?

[10] A: Yes.

[11] Q: Tell me what you can recollect if anything, just about  
[12] the varying versions and so on.

[13] A: Well, you've got the team of Brown and Brown, you know,  
[14] that don't really want this. I mean you know. They're  
[15] upset. I mean you know Board members don't — because  
[16] you are all talking about it, and it comes up they don't  
[17] want it.

[18] Noel is extremely religious, too. And I don't  
[19] really remember Noel, but I know Noel was talking. I  
[20] don't remember everything that he said. I know Noel was  
[21] talking about things, too.

[22] You know, just the two sides going head to head on  
[23] this stuff like they do. I really wasn't in that, you  
[24] know. None of it is my thing. The bio textbooks and  
[25] everything are not what I wanted to devote my time and

Page 69

Page 71

[1] That is how I feel.  
[2] Q: That's what I want to get at, Angie. I know that you  
[3] have a feeling. I understand, I think I have a sense  
[4] for the context that produced that. But like Eric, what  
[5] is really important here is kind of what was said.  
[6] There's sort of what you feel.  
[7] A: Yeah.  
[8] Q: And what was said.  
[9] A: You are saying that perhaps I am getting an idea when I  
[10] shouldn't. That could be.  
[11] Q: I want to be fair. That's my goal here, to find out  
[12] what you know.  
[13] A: Okay.  
[14] Q: But there is a big difference between people talking  
[15] about their religion and making you uncomfortable  
[16] because you think it is an important personal matter.  
[17] A: Right.  
[18] Q: And people saying I want to witness my faith.  
[19] A: Absolutely.  
[20] Q: And you feeling uncomfortable because you feel I live my  
[21] faith through good deeds and charitable words.  
[22] A: I do.  
[23] Q: I understand that. But what we are talking about here  
[24] is this sense you had that if you didn't vote the way  
[25] Bill —

Page 70

Page 72

[1] A: Right.  
[2] Q: — or Allen wanted you to vote, you have the sense they  
[3] would feel you were not a Christian?  
[4] A: Not a Christian, plus probably betrayed for friendship,  
[5] too. I have done more for Bill than Alan. So we are  
[6] friends, too. I'm sure he doesn't feel like this any  
[7] more. I think he feels I betrayed him by going against  
[8] him — or the Board, not in person or anything.  
[9] I never did anything against him, but he feels  
[10] this is against you if you don't go along because he  
[11] thinks it is important.  
[12] Q: Now I don't want to belabor this point. What I want to  
[13] do is focus you and me on what was said. I want to ask  
[14] you: Did Alan Bonsell ever say anything to you along  
[15] these lines if you don't vote for the curriculum change,  
[16] you are not a good Christian?  
[17] A: No, not Alan. I don't think Alan would do that.  
[18] Q: Did Sheila Harkins ever say anything to that effect?  
[19] A: Never.  
[20] Q: Did Heather Geesey ever say anything to that effect?  
[21] A: No, not that I recall right now, no.  
[22] Q: Did Noel Wenrich ever say anything to that effect?  
[23] A: Noel and I had in depth conversations about, you know,  
[24] this, yes.  
[25] Q: My question was imprecise. I understand that you share

[1] a religious conviction to a certain measure.  
[2] A: Noel and I are definitely friends. I really enjoy his  
[3] two little kids. I have been invited to his house many  
[4] times with his mom cooking. His mom is quite a cook.  
[5] They are more friends, more personable, on a  
[6] personal level and friendship level than Bill or even  
[7] Alan. Alan invites you to his house a lot, but that is  
[8] always political.  
[9] Where Noel is like, you know, come for dinner just  
[10] to hang out. Because my husband died, they invited me  
[11] for dinner a lot, especially when he lived down in  
[12] Dover, not anymore. He is way too far away now. He did  
[13] invite me, you know.  
[14] Q: Well —  
[15] A: Several times, like three or four to dinner that I did  
[16] go. A couple of times, I couldn't. They have dinner a  
[17] lot, like inviting people in.  
[18] Q: And I understand. What I am trying —  
[19] A: We have exactly the same religion so we are more on the  
[20] same railroad tracks, you know, the Nazarene railroad  
[21] tracks.  
[22] Q: Got you. And what I am trying to —  
[23] A: I communicate better with him.  
[24] Q: Sure.  
[25] A: But Noel can be violent too, don't get me wrong. Noel,

[1] I haven't voted Noel's way a couple of times. Like the  
[2] building project, this isn't religion. This is the  
[3] building project that my vote caused it not to keep on  
[4] going. I don't think Jeff and him were very happy. But  
[5] I had a reason because I thought it was too much money.  
[6] Q: Sure.  
[7] A: That is why I did that.  
[8] Q: You know, what I am trying to do here is focus on the  
[9] curriculum change.  
[10] A: Okay.  
[11] Q: And distinguish the feeling that you had.  
[12] A: Noel and I did have conversations about that actually.  
[13] I think we feel the same, a little bit pressured.  
[14] Q: And, again, I want to take the feeling off it and focus  
[15] on what was said to you.  
[16] A: Okay.  
[17] Q: And ask you: Did Jane clever ever say to you, Angie, if  
[18] you don't vote for this, you are not very Christian?  
[19] A: No, no.  
[20] Q: Or any words to that effect?  
[21] A: Janie wouldn't. Janie is very well-spoken and  
[22] sophisticated. She doesn't dole out threats. Janie is  
[23] not like that. She is very, very just mannerly and very  
[24] well-spoken. She doesn't ever like accuse or maybe  
[25] accuse. Do you know what I mean? Saying like maybe you

Page 73

[1] ought to vote this way because I think you are not  
[2] Christian. Nothing like that. She wouldn't talk like  
[3] that I don't think.

[4] Q: Okay. It seems if I understand your answers correctly,  
[5] Bill made the statement to you?

[6] A: Yeah.

[7] Q: But nobody else did?

[8] A: No.

[9] MR. GILLEN: Off the record.

[10] (An off-the-record discussion was had.)

[11] (A break was taken.)

[12] AFTER RECESS

[13] BY MR. GILLEN:

[14] Q: Angie, let me ask you too, we are talking about the  
[15] October meeting then, and this is what I want to try and  
[16] get a better feel for.

[17] A: Okay.

[18] Q: You have got the meeting in August on the approval of  
[19] the text?

[20] A: Right, right, right.

[21] Q: You vote with Bill. And then there is an uproar, and  
[22] you say this may not be a good idea. There's a lot of  
[23] complaints. You switch your vote.

[24] Then we get to October, and the curriculum change  
[25] is up. Now did you have an understanding whether Of

Page 74

[1] Pandas was part of that curriculum change?

[2] A: Right. Right, yes.

[3] Q: I just want to get a sense for why did you vote with  
[4] Bill this time?

[5] A: Well, I don't think there's anything wrong with giving  
[6] the kids an overview of all of the theories, but it just  
[7] kept get worse and worse. That's why the complaints  
[8] kept getting louder and lawsuits and threats.

[9] Q: I understand what you are saying there about the way  
[10] those considerations have —

[11] A: Right, right.

[12] Q: — influenced your judgment.

[13] A: The threatening of lawsuits and Bill's money.

[14] Q: I do understand that. But that night, you decided to go  
[15] for the curriculum change?

[16] A: Right.

[17] Q: And I am trying to understand just what was your thought  
[18] there. Let me ask you another question.

[19] Did you feel that you had let Bill down?

[20] A: Yes.

[21] Q: In August?

[22] A: Yes.

[23] Q: Was that feeling that you had sort of said you would  
[24] vote with him, but not —

[25] A: Right.

Page 75

[1] Q: Was that a part of your —

[2] A: I think it was some of it, yeah.

[3] Q: And you say —

[4] A: Bill lets you know when you let him down, you know.

[5] Q: What did he say to you about that?

[6] A: Well, he was upset with me clearly. I mean he just said  
[7] I didn't want you to do that. Why did you do it? And I  
[8] said, well, I just didn't think it was a good idea at  
[9] the time. That is why I voted like that.

[10] He said I'm taking them back. They are going  
[11] backwards. Like that is how he feels. Every time he  
[12] makes progress, then he gets knocked back. I can  
[13] certainly understand how he feels, even if you don't  
[14] agree with him.

[15] Q: I understand. Now you get to October, and the vote is  
[16] coming up. Did Bill talk to you again?

[17] A: Yes. He just said can you try and hang in there with  
[18] me? Can you try and vote my way? I said I can try. I  
[19] can't guarantee that or promise that, you know.

[20] Q: But ultimately you did vote?

[21] A: Right.

[22] Q: With him?

[23] A: Right.

[24] Q: And am I understanding you correctly that there was a  
[25] notion of putting different theories —

Page 76

[1] A: Right, throwing them out there for the kids, yes.

[2] Q: When you passed that vote, did you think you were voting  
[3] for teaching Creationism in Dover biology class?

[4] A: I don't know if I would go that far. It wasn't said  
[5] like that, no.

[6] Q: Did you understand that Intelligent Design might somehow  
[7] be —

[8] A: Well, it could be construed as that, yeah. But if it is  
[9] just one of several theories, I don't think it is going  
[10] to stick in their head quite as much as just presenting  
[11] one theory. You present three which I sort of think  
[12] there are. That is how I think of it.

[13] Q: What three are those?

[14] A: You have your traditional Darwinism. You have your  
[15] Intelligent Design. The other theory, there is the  
[16] basic — I am simplifying this — the alien theory, you  
[17] know.

[18] Q: Okay. And just give me an understanding for the alien  
[19] theory part of it.

[20] A: Just that aliens brought the life forms here. In other  
[21] words, there's huge universes and galaxies way bigger  
[22] than ours, and they finally decide to settle here,  
[23] another theory. There is a name to it. I don't know  
[24] the name of it. They have a name, the people that  
[25] practice that and believe that.



Page 77

Page 79

[1] Q: Do you understand that those three theories —  
[2] Evolution, Intelligent Design and this Alien Theory —  
[3] as something distinct from Creationism?  
[4] A: Well, I think that Creationism ties in with all of them  
[5] to a point. You can read that in it such as where did  
[6] it really come from, if you really start asking  
[7] questions.  
[8] But I don't think — I know what they taught me in  
[9] ninth grade at Dover. Plain and simple, you are in and  
[10] out of it in one minute. You take the test. That is  
[11] it. You just keep moving on. I do remember it.  
[12] Ninth grader's minds aren't really sitting there  
[13] wondering what happened a billion years ago anyway.  
[14] That is not what their mind is on. I was a ninth grader  
[15] once.  
[16] MR. ROTHSCHILD: Please let's not go down that  
[17] road. Pat and I both have kids on that track.  
[18] A: Mostly getting a car and car insurance was the two  
[19] biggest things that stood in my way.  
[20] MR. ROTHSCHILD: That would be perfect.  
[21] MR. GILLEN: It is certainly more elevated than  
[22] men.  
[23] BY MR. GILLEN:  
[24] Q: When that meeting came up, I am looking now at the  
[25] public comment.

Page 78

Page 80

[1] A: Okay.  
[2] Q: Do you have any recollections of public comments made in  
[3] connection with the contemplated curriculum change at  
[4] the October 18th meeting?  
[5] A: Yes. They weren't happy as usual, yes.  
[6] Q: When you say they —  
[7] A: The usual gang.  
[8] Q: Just give me —  
[9] A: Callahan, Snook, all of them. They're parading up to  
[10] the podium.  
[11] Q: That is one group of former Board members?  
[12] A: Right.  
[13] Q: And then were the teachers present?  
[14] A: Yes. They always are.  
[15] Q: Was Bert Spahr present?  
[16] A: Yes. They always are.  
[17] Q: Do you recall whether Bert Spahr addressed whether the  
[18] teachers were teaching origins of life?  
[19] A: Yeah, yeah.  
[20] Q: Do you recall?  
[21] A: I am pretty sure she did. She just wants to know what  
[22] is going on and if they are going to be teaching that.  
[23] She is not happy about it obviously, very unhappy about  
[24] it.  
[25] Q: Do you recall whether she said the teachers don't teach

[1] origins of life?  
[2] A: Yeah. I believe she yelled that, we do not. It is  
[3] important to her not to teach it.  
[4] Q: Were there any other discussions from the public comment  
[5] that come to mind? Was Barrie Callahan there?  
[6] A: Yes, she's always there. Always there. Every meeting,  
[7] even planning. You have planning and the Board meeting  
[8] — the public Board meeting. She is always at both.  
[9] Very few time, she is not.  
[10] Q: Do you recall what she was saying or anything she said?  
[11] A: She doesn't want it. She is always complaining about  
[12] it.  
[13] Q: Do you recall what her reasons were for not wanting it?  
[14] A: She thinks you are doing damage to the kids. She does  
[15] believe you are damaging the children with it. I know  
[16] that.  
[17] I mean some of the stuff she says I guess makes  
[18] sense. She doesn't agree with it at all. It is a bad  
[19] idea. You are upsetting the teachers. You are  
[20] upsetting the public. You are upsetting the taxpayers.  
[21] You are upsetting her, the parents, because she has  
[22] kids. I mean she is right out with it. She doesn't  
[23] hold anything back.  
[24] Q: Right.  
[25] A: She doesn't believe you are doing a good thing, and she  
[1] tells you right out. Yes, she is involved with the  
[2] school with her children. She's a parent, not just a  
[3] taxpayer, a constituent, maybe somebody that voted for  
[4] you, maybe somebody that doesn't like you. She makes  
[5] that clear.  
[6] But I mean I guess she does have merit because the  
[7] parents should be there. More parents, different  
[8] parents would be nice rather than same people all the  
[9] time. That is all it ever is.  
[10] Even like the big debate that we just did, it is  
[11] always the same people. I said that to several people  
[12] in the room do you see, it is always the same teachers.  
[13] I think Dr. Nilsen requires the administration to  
[14] be there at least at so many meetings. I am pretty sure  
[15] they must be there. You should be to know what is going  
[16] on. It is always the same. It would be nice to see  
[17] some different faces.  
[18] Again, that's where you become complacent and not  
[19] listen to them because it always the same people up  
[20] there complaining about the same thing. They kind of  
[21] sound the same because they are always complaining. It  
[22] could be a different subject, but they are always there.  
[23] Q: I do understand. When you voted for the change despite  
[24] the objections, I know you have referenced that Bill  
[25] asked you if you could stick with him?



Page 81

[1] A: Right.  
[2] Q: Different theories?  
[3] A: Yes.  
[4] Q: Was there anything else that was a part of your decision  
[5] at the time?  
[6] A: Well, I guess initially, I never knew it was going to  
[7] cause this much trouble or get this big or even go this  
[8] far. Who would have ever dreamed? I didn't think so.  
[9] I mean Noel told me that Bill wants to take this  
[10] to the Supreme Court. I just totally dismissed Noel. I  
[11] said stop it, Noel, like you're really blowing something  
[12] out of proportion. That is what I meant. I was a  
[13] little bit aggravated with him. I said stop, you know.  
[14] I never dreamed it would even go this far. Not  
[15] even as far as it went before this. I didn't really  
[16] think it was going to blow up like this or cause this  
[17] much problems or damage, you know, as in getting  
[18] lawyers, everybody suing everybody. Half thinking one  
[19] way, half thinking the other.  
[20] Q: Okay.  
[21] A: Which is like splitting everybody. They are arguing.  
[22] Q: I know that since you voted in October, on October 18th,  
[23] you have changed your view?  
[24] A: Yes.  
[25] Q: And you have referenced a comment that Mr. Buckingham

Page 82

[1] made that you felt under pressure?  
[2] A: I did feel pressure, yeah. That comes from other  
[3] confrontations, too, that wouldn't even be about this.  
[4] Do you know what I mean?  
[5] If they are expecting you to help them out, you're  
[6] expecting a friend to show up to help you move, and they  
[7] don't show up, and you have got four friends instead of  
[8] eight, boy, your back's talking to you.  
[9] It is the same deal. It comes it is like, you  
[10] know, like a Domino Theory, boom, boom, boom. I mean  
[11] Bill lets you know. Alan and Janie aren't like that,  
[12] the ones that — the other ones.  
[13] I mean I think that Bill and Alan and Janie and  
[14] Noel would be, and Heather to a degree, but Heather  
[15] isn't in with my grouping of Alan, Bill, and Janie and  
[16] Noel as really being very, very deeply religious and  
[17] letting people know about it —  
[18] Q: Sure.  
[19] A: — as a conviction and promise to their church probably.  
[20] I am just saying that. I don't know that to be a fact.  
[21] Q: And —  
[22] A: They didn't say that, you know. But they are doing what  
[23] they think they should do.  
[24] Q: Let me just — I am trying to focus on the reasons you  
[25] have rethought your decision. And I know Eric has asked

Page 83

[1] you about the comment you made concerning feeling  
[2] pressure —  
[3] A: Yeah.  
[4] Q: — because you might be considered unChristian?  
[5] A: I still feel pressure. Even though I am completely off  
[6] the Board, when I go in and sit down in the conference  
[7] room where they put you, they take you there. You're  
[8] not allowed to be with the public for the debate. Alan  
[9] doesn't talk to me.  
[10] You can feel it. It's divided everybody. It's a  
[11] big divide. It is like the 800 pound gorilla is what  
[12] the newspaper calls it, and it is. You might not talk  
[13] about it, but it is there.  
[14] And the other members glare at you. It is not a  
[15] pleasant look. It is not hey, how are you doing?  
[16] Sheila always talks to me. She is not like this.  
[17] Holding these grudges and fighting all the time, Sheila  
[18] is not like that. But some of the other ones are like  
[19] it is personal, it is not just political and business.  
[20] It's like running a 33 million dollar business.  
[21] That is what you are doing. That is your job. It is  
[22] like a corporation, even though it is not. It is public  
[23] education.  
[24] Q: Yes. And I understand what you are saying about the  
[25] lobbying and the political things.

Page 84

[1] A: It goes on all the time. It is just politics.  
[2] Q: Sure.  
[3] A: It is what they do.  
[4] Q: Let me ask you this: It is just politics except I think  
[5] from what you have told us today, you viewed Bill  
[6] Buckingham's comment to you, that wasn't politics?  
[7] A: He has a way of offending people. He is getting too  
[8] much into it. I guess he considers this as his  
[9] personal, you know, like baby that he is watching grow.  
[10] You know? Like taking a plant or puppy, you have a  
[11] personal thing that you really like, and you are going  
[12] to watch it grow. That's how I feel.  
[13] Q: Well, and —  
[14] A: I think Alan has always wanted to change it, but Alan  
[15] isn't overt like Bill is. Alan is more reserved like  
[16] his mom and dad are and his grandma. He is more  
[17] reserved and more quiet and, you know, low spoken.  
[18] Q: Sure.  
[19] A: Whereas Bill is out there swinging like with Noel. He  
[20] is right up there.  
[21] Q: And what I am trying to get at, Angie, is you have  
[22] indicated now looking back at it, you think I didn't  
[23] make the right decision. I would like to change it.  
[24] A: I just want to go back a little bit and let's sit down  
[25] again.

Page 85

[1] Q: Sit down for what purpose?  
[2] A: To rethink these things and talk about it a little bit  
[3] more. That is all I wanted. I didn't think I asked for  
[4] that much.  
[5] Q: And among the considerations, I want to make sure I  
[6] understand you. There's a couple of considerations you  
[7] have referenced that have prompted this rethinking of  
[8] your vote?  
[9] A: Right.  
[10] Q: We know there is a comment you said Bill made?  
[11] A: Yes.  
[12] Q: You said there is a divide in the community?  
[13] A: Yes, it is.  
[14] Q: There is disapproval —  
[15] A: Yes.  
[16] Q: — on the part of some people?  
[17] A: Absolutely.  
[18] Q: Is there anything else that explains why you wanted to  
[19] revisit it?  
[20] A: The cost. The cost of trying to change everything. I  
[21] mean the cost is going to be tremendous.  
[22] Q: You think it is just not worth it?  
[23] A: Yeah, yeah. I think there can be some more important  
[24] things that we have got to be focusing on. It takes  
[25] your attention away from everything else, and nothing

Page 86

[1] else gets done. I think it is going to be awful  
[2] expensive.  
[3] I kept telling Alan that just like the paper says,  
[4] I mean there could be lawsuits. It could be expensive.  
[5] There could be a lot of problems.  
[6] And everybody like Steve Russell, no, no,  
[7] everything is fine. You think you should listen to your  
[8] School District solicitor that everything is going to be  
[9] fine. But as it got bigger and bigger, the problem kept  
[10] like a snowball, you know. You're thinking this may be  
[11] expensive.  
[12] Q: Okay. And I do understand —  
[13] A: And, of course, problematic, too. Expensive and  
[14] problematic.  
[15] Q: By which you mean the tension in the community?  
[16] A: Yes, and they are not agreeing. And my neighbors are  
[17] standing in front of my car bitching about it what are  
[18] you doing? And they will yell at you as you go by. It  
[19] caused problems, and it still is.  
[20] They are not over yet, that they don't agree. I  
[21] guess they think well, I put you there. I voted for  
[22] you, but now you are doing something that I don't agree  
[23] with. So what are you doing?  
[24] They just question you right out. Us, us, the  
[25] taxpayers are responsible for you having — it is just a

Page 87

[1] volunteer job. It isn't like we get paid or anything.  
[2] We spend a lot of time and effort and of our own  
[3] money helping kids like donating things. With York  
[4] County High, something like that, I always gave them  
[5] money for books and things in there, the kids that I  
[6] would get involved with.  
[7] The taxpayers feel that you owe them an answer,  
[8] which I think you do. Like what are you doing with my  
[9] money? Well, you need to be accountable. You can't  
[10] just pass the buck to Dr. Nilsen or Denise Russell, who  
[11] used to be the business manager. You can't keep passing  
[12] bucks. You are like the bottom, the end, the buck stops  
[13] here, you know.  
[14] And the voters would say that to me. You are not  
[15] going to do this and that because that's going to cost  
[16] us money. Stop doing that. I think maybe we should go  
[17] back and talk about it and maybe get some community  
[18] answers.  
[19] These taxpayers are yelling at me should come in  
[20] with a group, and we all sit down and rethink it and  
[21] talk about it. I mean they should talk to Alan and  
[22] Bill. My neighbors who were complaining, there were  
[23] three of them, they should come in and talk with Bill  
[24] and Alan.  
[25] Bill and Alan aren't hearing what I am hearing.

Page 88

[1] They are very adamant about it. They have an opinion,  
[2] and that has to count.  
[3] Q: Yes. So it is —  
[4] A: That's what tends to lobby me in their way.  
[5] Q: So it is that constituent pressure?  
[6] A: Yes.  
[7] Q: And these considerations?  
[8] A: They put you where you are at. They will tell you that,  
[9] which is a little bit embarrassing if they think you are  
[10] going against what their wishes are. So why are you  
[11] doing that? You know.  
[12] If you say well, I am just helping out my friends,  
[13] Bill and Alan, who probably think it's a good idea or  
[14] Heather or Janie, then they say look, we are paying the  
[15] Bill for this, stop doing it.  
[16] Q: Okay. Now am I right, Angie, that you are running for  
[17] School Board? Did you mention that?  
[18] A: Yes, two years, not four.  
[19] Q: Did you say you are running with the Browns?  
[20] A: The Browns. Mrs. Brown wants to be written in. She  
[21] didn't want the commitment and the fighting. But  
[22] Mr. Brown and I came back sort of on our own little  
[23] ticket between Dover School Board and between Dover  
[24] Cares.  
[25] Dover Cares is a takeoff of Barrie Callahan's last

Page 89

[1] group. She is involved with that. The Board is  
[2] involved with themselves with this. Me, Mr. Brown and  
[3] there's two others that just sort of go on their own.  
[4] Q: What is your platform as a group; do you have one?  
[5] A: I think that I would like people mostly to know that I  
[6] am conservative. We try not to waste their tax dollars.  
[7] I don't really think we are involved in this Intelligent  
[8] Design thing, you know.  
[9] I mean I just don't want to pay a big bill that I  
[10] am afraid the taxpayers are going to get hit with. That  
[11] is the only way, the things that I would talk about it.  
[12] I really haven't had anybody really grill me about  
[13] it. They just complain, or they are for it. And then  
[14] they will make comments. Again, here we go with the  
[15] comments don't you believe in God? It is like, of  
[16] course, I believe in God.  
[17] You know, it's really a difficult thing to be  
[18] caught in the middle of it. Mostly I want them to know  
[19] that Mr. Brown and I — I believe the Browns are right  
[20] on Board with me in trying to take the six cents on  
[21] every dollar that you control and try to squeeze it and  
[22] get the best education for the dollar. Mostly  
[23] conservative.  
[24] Q: Do I understand correctly that whatever action you would  
[25] take about Intelligent Design is driven by that fiscal

Page 90

[1] consideration?  
[2] A: Absolutely.  
[3] Q: You just don't think it is worth it?  
[4] A: Yeah, I really don't.  
[5] Q: Have the Browns discussed this curriculum change with  
[6] you?  
[7] A: Yeah.  
[8] Q: What is their —  
[9] A: I invited them to my house. We all get on it.  
[10] Q: What is their position?  
[11] A: Of course, my dad is there. And Dr. Troxell is always  
[12] there, my neighbor who doesn't want to pay for it. And  
[13] friends, you know, mostly it is always like Mr. and  
[14] Mrs. Brown, and me, and Dr. Troxell and my dad, these  
[15] are the ones that will talk about it.  
[16] Well, Casey has been disillusioned for a while.  
[17] She got real upset and Jeff much quicker than I did. I  
[18] tried to hang in there hoping for just everybody to get  
[19] along and a resolution, hoping for some middle ground.  
[20] Q: Casey and Jeff Brown both resigned; correct?  
[21] A: Yes.  
[22] Q: Have they told you why they resigned?  
[23] A: They are very upset about it.  
[24] Q: About it meaning Intelligent Design?  
[25] A: Yes.

Page 91

[1] Q: What have they said?  
[2] A: Well, they don't think it is fair, you know. It's not  
[3] representing — when you are in public office, you have  
[4] to represent everybody. You can't just say I go to  
[5] Harmony Grove Community Church, and that is the only  
[6] religion and the way.  
[7] They are very upset because they feel that Bill is  
[8] saying that his religion is the only religion that is  
[9] right, and this is the only way to go.  
[10] You can't do that. As a public official, you need  
[11] to represent everyone of all faiths, beliefs and walks  
[12] of life, and, you know, socioeconomic conditions that  
[13] they have. And they are very worried about the money.  
[14] They live out in Washington Township where people  
[15] — there are some big farmers that have a lot of money,  
[16] but a lot of people don't in Dover. I mean period. In  
[17] Dover Township, Dover Borough and Washington Township,  
[18] they just don't have a lot of disposable income to throw  
[19] around or a lot of money.  
[20] Q: Am I correct that the Browns think that Bill has done  
[21] this for religious reasons?  
[22] A: Oh, yes. I think that.  
[23] Q: And why do you think that?  
[24] A: I think the Browns think that, and I think it. I think  
[25] Bill has had a hard road. I think that he is suffering

Page 92

[1] a great deal with physical horrible pain everyday.  
[2] I think — that he told me the only way he gets  
[3] through it is by the grace of God. I guess to be alive  
[4] even after being shot and thrown from a high balcony,  
[5] injuries, bad injuries in his jobs.  
[6] Q: Did he say anything else to you that ties this  
[7] curriculum change or his service — has he tied his  
[8] service on the School Board to his gratefulness to God?  
[9] A: All the School Board is just people hurling shit at you  
[10] 360 degrees. It comes at you from every angle. I don't  
[11] think you thank God for that. No, I don't think so.  
[12] I mean it's a miserable job. They just complain  
[13] and yell at you. I mean as soon as you think you have  
[14] the front under control, the back starts. And when it  
[15] is under control, both sides start. It is just all the  
[16] way around all the time.  
[17] No, I don't think he is thankful for it, no. I  
[18] know I'm not.  
[19] Q: And yet you have done it and you do it out of public  
[20] service?  
[21] A: Yes. I have been involved with it for a while. Even my  
[22] sone was little, I was always on the PTO. You bake and  
[23] you bake and you sell things. You know I was always  
[24] involved ever since the beginning when PJ entered  
[25] kindergarten half a day. That was just five of nine to

Page 93

[1] eleven. You are always in there. Back then, I had to  
[2] drive him both ways or hire a babysitter to do it. That  
[3] is when I started really getting involved. It is 22  
[4] years of service since he has been five up there in  
[5] Dover, just Dover, that's it, not other schools.

[6] Just York County High and the School of Technology  
[7] because he went there then. I went there for classes.  
[8] I think it's a good program because not everybody is  
[9] geared to college or prepared or able for it I think or  
[10] financially able to go in Dover.

[11] MR. ROTHSCILD: How much longer do you think,  
[12] Pat?

[13] MR. GILLEN: Not too much longer.

[14] BY MR. GILLEN:

[15] Q: You mentioned when Eric was questioning you that you do  
[16] remember Bill making a comment about two thousand years  
[17] ago?

[18] A: Yeah. He wasn't happy. He gets too upset when people  
[19] don't agree with him. You can't get all whacked out  
[20] yelling like that on a Board because it happens.

[21] Q: That is what I wanted to ask you. Was he responding to  
[22] comments made by someone what he made that?

[23] A: Yes. Him and Mr. Brown are always fighting. They are  
[24] always going at it because Mr. Brown takes offense, too,  
[25] to his comments.

Page 94

[1] Q: To his comments —

[2] A: They are firing it across the table all the time.

[3] Q: Takes offense to Bill's comments about what?

[4] A: Religion, yeah. He takes offense because I guess the  
[5] Browns don't think it belongs there in public service.

[6] Q: Well, let me ask you when Bill said that, do you have a  
[7] recollection whether that was in June of 2004 or could  
[8] it have been another time?

[9] A: I asked Mrs. Brown because Mrs. Brown has documents.  
[10] She saves everything, and I don't. Casey said it was  
[11] June.

[12] I said when was this? I remember it like  
[13] yesterday. I just sit there with Sheila and oh, boy,  
[14] here we go. And Casey said it was June.

[15] Q: But apart from what Casey —

[16] A: But I don't have notes.

[17] Q: — Brown told you, do you have any specific recollection  
[18] of whether it occurred in June or maybe at sometime  
[19] before or after?

[20] A: I think it was June. I don't think it was before that  
[21] because Mr. Brown says it was November before that with  
[22] the Pledge of Allegiance. But I don't remember that.  
[23] You are going back two years now, November.

[24] Q: I do. And everyone who has been asked to testify —

[25] A: I asked Casey specifically. I said it was last summer;

Page 95

[1] right? She said yes, it was June of 2004. I said okay.

[2] Q: Let me ask you that there have been some quotes here we  
[3] have discussed today, quotes that have been attributed  
[4] to Bill or attributed to you. Have you had experience  
[5] with inaccurate reporting in the papers?

[6] A: Yes.

[7] Q: Give me who —

[8] A: Their business is to sell papers. They are going to  
[9] sensationalize. That is what the paper does, they sell  
[10] papers, you know.

[11] Q: Have you had over the course of this dispute —

[12] A: Yes.

[13] Q: — have you seen reporting that you knew was inaccurate?

[14] A: I think they exaggerate to sell more papers, yes.

[15] Q: Can you recall any specifics that sort of prompted that  
[16] thought on your part?

[17] A: It is all the time. The newspapers do exaggerate to  
[18] makes things look worse than they do to sell papers.  
[19] You will walk by and say ah, and you will pick it up and  
[20] buy it. That is what they want.

[21] Yeah, I think they do all the time. Everyday.

[22] Q: Do you feel like that exaggeration has been part of the  
[23] reporting here?

[24] A: Yes, they are right on this. But this is big, you know.  
[25] They made it big, too, you know.

Page 96

[1] Q: What do you mean by that?

[2] A: But it is big. I think they have splattered it  
[3] everywhere. People are so sick of looking at Dover in  
[4] the paper, and so am I.

[5] I think you will tend not to read it. I think it  
[6] is going to go against them. People come up to me and  
[7] say if I see Dover in the paper again, I am going to  
[8] vomit. If I see Dover in the paper again, I am so sick  
[9] of it. What is the matter? I know.

[10] It is like we are always in the paper. So then  
[11] people think there is something wrong with us. So I  
[12] guess if you are arguing all the time, there could be  
[13] something wrong with you. If you are always fighting  
[14] with people, that is not normal either, you know. It  
[15] does make us look bad.

[16] Q: Let me —

[17] A: I think we look bad. I think I look bad.

[18] Q: Let me ask you about Joe Maldonado. Earlier Eric showed  
[19] you a quote.

[20] A: He is always there. He is like a fixture. He is always  
[21] at every meeting, and he is into it.

[22] Q: And by into it, you mean?

[23] A: He is into all this. He listens more intently than any  
[24] reporter I have ever seen. I mean he does his job and  
[25] way over.



Page 97

[1] Q: When he reported you saying that many on the Board had  
[2] pressured you —  
[3] A: Right.  
[4] Q: You said today —  
[5] A: I just made the statement I feel pressured. I didn't  
[6] say many. I said I feel pressured.  
[7] Q: I believe you testified today that it was Bill who —  
[8] A: I think I told him that. He's there with Bill yelling  
[9] at me. How can you not feel pressure when someone is  
[10] over there yelling at you do you know what you have  
[11] done? You have ruined everything.  
[12] Q: So in that instance Joe Maldonado's reporting was  
[13] inaccurate?  
[14] A: He sensationalizes es to sell papers. It is money. It  
[15] is all about money.  
[16] Q: Do you believe that he has done that at other times —  
[17] A: I am sure.  
[18] Q: — in reporting disputes?  
[19] A: I just can't pick out a newspaper article and read it to  
[20] out of my brain. I don't have that kind of  
[21] recollection, but I am sure that yes, that would be  
[22] true. Definitely, definitely.  
[23] Q: How about the other reporters who have been sort of  
[24] focused, Heidi Bernhard Bubbs for example?  
[25] A: Heidi, I forgot about that one.

Page 98

[1] Q: Have you had an impression as you went along that she —  
[2] A: Yes.  
[3] Q: — has been inaccurate?  
[4] A: Yes. I don't have any personal experience with her, but  
[5] yes, yeah. She more goes for Alan and whoever is Board  
[6] President. I saw her making a beeline. She wants the  
[7] top, the President or the Vice-President. She is not so  
[8] much into the Board members. I noticed that she goes  
[9] for the top, yeah. It is more — that's her thing, but  
[10] it is everywhere.  
[11] Q: How about Lauri Lebo, did you have a sense as you went  
[12] through that Lauri was always inaccurate?  
[13] A: My opinion of Lauri is she is really aggressive in  
[14] getting her story and trying to find you and trying to  
[15] reach you like an aggressive reporter. Whereas other  
[16] two are more whatever. They will just take whoever is  
[17] there. They don't care.  
[18] Lauri more goes after you. Like she is more like  
[19] tracking you down. The other two, no, they don't track  
[20] you down. It is whatever, whoever is there.  
[21] Q: Is it possible — do you remember whether Bill  
[22] Buckingham could have said that comment to the effect  
[23] that Christ died 2,000 years ago more than once while  
[24] you were on the School Board?  
[25] A: He could have. I know that he is into that.

Page 99

[1] Q: Well, in an effort to —  
[2] A: The comment makes you feel bad. You know what I mean?  
[3] I mean some of the stuff Bill says makes me feel bad.  
[4] You know, like you are not grateful that somebody died  
[5] for you, I assume that is what he is trying to get  
[6] across to Mr. Brown who he is yelling at across the  
[7] table, that Mr. Brown is ungrateful.  
[8] Mr. Brown just takes it the other way.  
[9] Q: Do you remember that comment being directed to  
[10] Mr. Brown?  
[11] A: I thought it was to Mr. Brown. Like the Muslims and  
[12] everything, they fight. Him and Mr. Brown go at it like  
[13] him and Mr. Wenrich. They go at it.  
[14] I don't think — people like Sheila and I, we are  
[15] not into that hand to hand combat, if you will. We are  
[16] more laid back.  
[17] Q: You've mentioned that it is your sense that Intelligent  
[18] Design speaks to the existence of God?  
[19] A: Yes.  
[20] Q: Let me ask you again: Do you recall any other Board  
[21] members saying that?  
[22] A: Well, you know, not really like that, no. Not like you  
[23] are saying it, no. I mean they don't stand up and say  
[24] this is God. Now you people vote for it.  
[25] They don't do that, no.

Page 100

[1] Q: Did you think that other Board members made that link?  
[2] A: I think so.  
[3] Q: Why, Angie? Just tell me.  
[4] A: I think I feel the same way as Bill when you walked into  
[5] that science room and see that unprofessional very  
[6] anatomically graphic picture of the apes, it does  
[7] definitely offend you. It has got to offend some  
[8] people. Probably more than fifty percent I would say  
[9] would be an educated guess.  
[10] It is kind of a strange mural. It was kind of  
[11] weird. I mean it is different like just sitting in bio  
[12] like I did in ninth grade, my God, we are going back  
[13] here 33 years. I had Mr. Meyers, bio teacher, and he  
[14] says it in one second and goes on.  
[15] When you see the mural, it is bound to offend some  
[16] people. It can see his point.  
[17] Q: The mural —  
[18] A: Yes.  
[19] Q: — being offensive?  
[20] A: Absolutely. It is. I mean it is like ape and you, only  
[21] in male.  
[22] Q: You have referenced this notion that you think Bill was  
[23] grateful in trying to give something back?  
[24] A: Yes, I do.  
[25] Q: Is that based on generalized discussions about his



Page 101

[1] religious convictions?

[2] A: I think it is his health problems. I think that he even  
[3] attributes God to being alive. By rights, he probably  
[4] shouldn't be being thrown off that balcony like he was,  
[5] taking that kind of fall from that height and a bullet.

[6] Q: I do get that, but what I am trying to say is is that  
[7] his attitude towards life generally, or was it his  
[8] attitude specifically as he approached the biology  
[9] curriculum?

[10] A: I think towards life.

[11] Q: How about Alan? You said he has made statements to the  
[12] effect that God has been good to me?

[13] A: Yes.

[14] Q: God has been good to my wife?

[15] A: Yes, he is. But Alan says it an awful lot.

[16] Q: I do understand that. And I understand when you say I  
[17] am uncomfortable with that.

[18] A: It is other things, too. It is not just that. With all  
[19] of the campaigning, you go into Alan's kitchen/bathroom,  
[20] and there's this huge sign in front of you when you are  
[21] trying to go to the bathroom that says have you thanked  
[22] God today. There's other things. It is like wow.

[23] Other Board members have made comments to me about  
[24] it, too. I am not the only one that feels —

[25] Q: I understand, Angie.

Page 102

[1] A: — that they are sitting on your shoulders jamming it  
[2] down your throat. That is how you feel. You feel like  
[3] the religion is coming at you. You are here, and oh,  
[4] boy.

[5] Q: I understand. Let me just say did Alan ever say God has  
[6] been good to me, and for God's sake, I am going to make  
[7] this curriculum change go through?

[8] A: No. Alan is not like that.

[9] Q: How about Heather Geesey, did she ever say God has been  
[10] good to me, too, and I am going to —

[11] A: She just says God has been good to her, and she is  
[12] grateful for everything she has. Mostly her kids who  
[13] are healthy. Not like that, no.

[14] Q: How about Jane Cleaver, same thing?

[15] A: No.

[16] Q: Did she ever make a statement along these lines?

[17] A: She thanks God a lot, but nothing like that.

[18] Q: Did Jane Cleaver ever make a statement to you to the  
[19] effect that God has been good to me, and therefore I am  
[20] going to ram this biology curriculum change through?

[21] A: No. Just that God has been good to her, no.

[22] Q: One final thing, just an area I want to make sure I  
[23] understand correctly. You have indicated that a lot of  
[24] what has gone on here, what you see is just politics?

[25] A: Right.

Page 103

[1] Q: You have indicated that people have tried to persuade,  
[2] and I know that Bill you recall making this comment that  
[3] made you very uncomfortable?

[4] A: Yeah.

[5] Q: Was there anything else in this process as we go through  
[6] it with people trying to persuade you one way or the  
[7] other on these issues, the biology text, Of Pandas and  
[8] People, the curriculum change that you thought was  
[9] outside the ordinary realm of School Board politics?

[10] A: Boy!

[11] Q: Focus on the Board members.

[12] A: That is going back in your memory. It has been going on  
[13] so long. And like you know probably walking down the  
[14] halls with Mr. Wenrich, we talked about it, like what a  
[15] mess.

[16] I remember walking from executive session to the  
[17] Board table with Mr. Wenrich, like we discussed things.  
[18] Like Mr. Brown and Mrs. Brown and I do, Ms. Casey Brown,  
[19] what a mess.

[20] Like it is like predictions. Like this could  
[21] really get bad. This could really grow. This could  
[22] really get into something that we probably don't want.  
[23] Like me an Noel, Noel, blah, blah, blah about Bill.

[24] It is always like the same with Noel and I, that  
[25] Bill wants to take it to the Supreme Court. I just go

Page 104

[1] oh, please, you have got to be kidding me. I remember  
[2] walking down the hall with Noel and Noel going that's  
[3] not a good idea. And I am thinking no, it is not, not  
[4] for money.

[5] It's like we walk around and verbally worry about  
[6] it. That is what we are doing. We are making  
[7] conversations and comments that we are worried. It was  
[8] mostly like Noel, me, Mr. and Mrs. Brown that we were  
[9] worried that this is really going to explode on the  
[10] scene that you don't want. I don't want it. They don't  
[11] want it.

[12] With those three — it was like four of us that  
[13] were worried probably a little bit ahead of time. We  
[14] were worried. And I thought at that time, we were  
[15] worried for nothing. Little did I ever know it would  
[16] get this big or I would ever even be here on this  
[17] beautiful river talking about it.

[18] I thought that Noel was really being excessively  
[19] paranoid stating the Supreme Court about anything. That  
[20] I remember.

[21] Q: And my question may have been —

[22] A: And Noel would say to me do you think this is a good  
[23] idea? And like the bottom line is there is nothing  
[24] wrong with some religion. People think this is too much  
[25] religion. Like there's nothing wrong with a little bit

Page 105

[1] of religion.  
[2] I think most of them would tolerate that. It is  
[3] crossing the line. It is raising the bar too much. It  
[4] is like just moderation in everything. That was the  
[5] comments when we were all worried in between ourselves  
[6] in private little walking down the hall conversations.  
[7] And me just thinking you are just worrying over  
[8] nothing. That is how I first took it. I didn't really  
[9] realize — and that's when I changed, when I realized it  
[10] is becoming an 800 pound gorilla.  
[11] Q: In terms of potential controversy?  
[12] A: Yes. I think it is kind of dumb that I didn't see it  
[13] coming.  
[14] Q: What I am trying to get at, Angie, is this: A lot of  
[15] what you said is it was just politicking?  
[16] A: Yes.  
[17] Q: Trying to get votes in line?  
[18] A: Yes.  
[19] Q: Trying to get you to stay with me?  
[20] A: Right.  
[21] Q: You've mentioned a comment by Bill which is outside of  
[22] the ordinary?  
[23] A: Okay.  
[24] Q: Vote with me, or you are unChristian?  
[25] A: Right, right, right.

Page 106

[1] Q: Compare this — it seems to me after talking to you that  
[2] that is sort of the specific thing you remember that was  
[3] outside the ordinary politicking?  
[4] A: Bill has been upset with me. He is a little too much  
[5] over the edge when he doesn't get his own way. Noel can  
[6] be very violent, like loud and like sort of coming after  
[7] you for things that you probably don't deserve that  
[8] much.  
[9] Q: But again, that is just ordinary sort of interpersonal  
[10] relationships?  
[11] A: I think it is a man thing. That is what I think. The  
[12] girls don't do this on this Board. Heather and Sheila  
[13] and Janie and me, we don't go after people yelling and  
[14] bellowing and waving our fists. We are not like that.  
[15] It is a man thing. It is the men that are doing  
[16] it, not the women. They are getting more upset than  
[17] they probably ought to be for a volunteer job, you know.  
[18] Q: There has been a great deal of Board deliberations on  
[19] the building project?  
[20] A: Yeah.  
[21] Q: Stop right there. And then we look at there has been a  
[22] lot of deliberation and discussion about the biology  
[23] curriculum change?  
[24] A: Oh, yeah.  
[25] Q: If you compare the activities of the Board members, the

Page 107

[1] heated exchanges and so on, are they about the same in  
[2] your judgment?  
[3] A: Well, there was one time that Mr. Brown and Mr. Wenrich  
[4] were very mad at me because I was the vote that said no  
[5] to go on with the building project. They were very  
[6] upset with me.  
[7] The only one that was close to Bill is Noel. Not  
[8] Brown. Brown is more like funny. He makes things a  
[9] joke. You never really know what side of the fence  
[10] Mr. Brown is on.  
[11] Q: What I am trying to get at is the pressure that you felt  
[12] from Board members to go their way. And what I am  
[13] trying to see, Angie, is this is a political Board?  
[14] A: Yes.  
[15] Q: People hold their positions pretty intensely.  
[16] A: Yes, they do.  
[17] Q: Do you think that those two processes in terms of the  
[18] strength of the conviction of the members, the  
[19] activities they engaged in to try to get together a vote  
[20] of five were about the same?  
[21] A: I think the one time with Noel is the same as Bill, yes,  
[22] the one time that Noel yelled at me.  
[23] Q: Just the process overall.  
[24] A: The building project?  
[25] Q: Yes. Has that been the same?

Page 108

[1] A: That was a nightmare, too, trying to cut money.  
[2] Q: Let me ask you one other question about the October 18th  
[3] meeting.  
[4] Do you recall speaking with Bryan Rehm at a break  
[5] in that meeting?  
[6] A: I have only had one conversation with him. I called him  
[7] at his house.  
[8] Q: You don't recall speaking with him at the break?  
[9] A: No. I called him at his house.  
[10] Q: Do you recall what you spoke about when you —  
[11] A: Yes. I told him that he can't run for Board if he is  
[12] suing the Board. You can't sue yourself. That's what I  
[13] told him. It doesn't make a lot of sense here to sue  
[14] yourself.  
[15] Q: Did you make any comments to him to the effect that the  
[16] Board was spending its executive session figuring out  
[17] how to thwart his candidacy?  
[18] A: I said they were talking about him in the execution  
[19] session, that you can't sue yourself. That it is kind  
[20] of dumb to sue yourself.  
[21] Q: Did you make any comments to Mr. Rehm to the effect that  
[22] the Board was working on a plan to ostracize him or  
[23] isolate him if he —  
[24] A: I don't think anybody likes him. I think he comes  
[25] across as arrogant and condescending. That is how I

Page 109

[1] feel in the presence of Bryan a lot. I know Bryan is  
[2] very angry with each and every one of us.  
[3] Q: Did Bryan speak at the public meetings?  
[4] A: Yes, yes.  
[5] Q: When you were at the Board —  
[6] A: He has a very thundering voice. He is very loud and  
[7] very take charge and very pissed off. I think that  
[8] would be a good way to sum up Bryan in two words.  
[9] Q: During your tenure on the Board, were you disposed to  
[10] credit his positions, or did you have the sense he was  
[11] complaining?  
[12] A: He is always complaining, like the rest of them. He  
[13] complains a lot. He is not a happy camper, and he has  
[14] been very unhappy with each and every one of us. When  
[15] he was interviewed to be on the Board with all the  
[16] resignations, he was hostile. He's not too happy.  
[17] Q: Did he participate in the meet the candidates evening  
[18] recently?  
[19] A: Yeah, yeah.  
[20] Q: Did he speak to Intelligent Design?  
[21] A: Yes. He is very loud and very forceful, like his voice.  
[22] He is well-spoken, yet it is just this constant  
[23] condescending — like he talks down to everybody. My  
[24] assistant wonders why he doesn't teach at MIT and  
[25] Harvard, the way he acts so superior to everyone. That

Page 110

[1] is how my assistant feels when he is bellowing to the  
[2] crowd. I definitely feel that way, too.  
[3] I try to talk to people just like they are people,  
[4] just like we are having a conversation. I try not to be  
[5] so rehearsed like Dover Cares is and so professional. I  
[6] think that a lot of people think it's condescending, and  
[7] I agree.  
[8] It's like talking down to you like you are  
[9] nothing, don't you understand how brilliant I am in  
[10] physics and biology and everything.  
[11] Q: Did you see him engaged in exchanges with other  
[12] candidates or Board members at the meetings?  
[13] A: Yes.  
[14] Q: How would you describe those?  
[15] A: Combative.  
[16] Q: Would they be akin, similar to the exchanges you have  
[17] seen among existing Board members during your tenure on  
[18] the Board?  
[19] A: Yeah, yeah. It is politics.  
[20] Q: Have you spoken with any of the plaintiffs in this  
[21] litigation?  
[22] A: Yeah.  
[23] Q: Who?  
[24] A: Cynthia Sneath and Beth Eveland.  
[25] Q: Can you recall what you said?

Page 111

[1] A: Yeah. I went up to — I told Walczak who said that they  
[2] were suing the District, I went to the State House. And  
[3] I asked Cindy and Beth — I always felt I could speak  
[4] with them. They seemed nice and definitely open to  
[5] talking. I talked to them several times.  
[6] But I mean the one thing that sticks out is I  
[7] asked Cynthia to run. She said she is too busy to run  
[8] for Board. She runs a home based business which takes  
[9] seven days a week.  
[10] I talked to Cynthia and Beth about what was the  
[11] matter. I mean why are you so upset about everything;  
[12] what did you want? How would you feel better? They  
[13] have always been very nice to me, and I am able to talk  
[14] to them.  
[15] The rest of them, no, I haven't spoken to any of  
[16] them.  
[17] MR. GILLEN: I have no further questions.  
[18] MR. ROTHSCHILD: I have no more questions. Thank  
[19] you very much.  
[20] (The deposition was concluded at 12:50 p.m.)  
[21]  
[22]  
[23]  
[24]  
[25]

Page 112

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA :  
COUNTY OF CUMBERLAND :  
I, Vicki L. Fox, Reporter and Notary Public in and  
for the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and County of  
Cumberland, do hereby certify that the foregoing  
testimony was taken before me at the time and place  
hereinbefore set forth, and that it is the testimony of:  
ANGIE YINGLING  
I further certify that said witness was by me duly  
sworn to testify the whole and complete truth in said  
cause; that the testimony then given was reported by me  
stenographically, and subsequently transcribed under my  
direction and supervision; and that the foregoing is a  
full, true and correct transcript of my original  
shorthand notes.  
I further certify that I am not counsel for nor  
related to any of the parties to the foregoing cause,  
nor employed by them or their attorneys, and am not  
interested in the subject matter or outcome thereof.  
Dated at Camp Hill, Pennsylvania, this 6th day of  
May, 2005.  
Vicki L. Fox  
Reporter - Notary Public  
(The foregoing certification does not apply to any  
reproduction of the same by any means unless under the  
direct control and/or supervision of the certifying  
reporter.)